

**MINUTES
CITY OF ST. CHARLES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY, MARCH 5, 2014
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM**

Members Present: Chairman Smunt, Bobowiec, Gibson, Malay, Norris, Pretz, Withey (7:05)

Members Absent: None

Also Present: Russell Colby, Planning Division Manager

1. Call to order:

Chairman Smunt called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm.

2. Roll call:

Chairman Smunt called roll with six members present. There was a quorum.

3. Approval of the agenda:

Chairman Smunt added an item under additional business- 7b. Municipal Parking Lot Redesign.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Bobowiec with a unanimous voice vote to approve the addition to the agenda.

4. Presentation of minutes from February 19, 2014 meeting.

A motion was made by Mr. Bobowiec and seconded by Mr. Gibson with a unanimous voice vote to approve the minutes as presented.

5. COA: 314 W. Main St. (façade improvement project)

Mr. Colby said the Commission's discussion and comments from the last meeting were shared with the applicant, Al Justiniano, and his architect, Dan Marshall, who were present to respond.

Mr. Marshall said he was not recommending use of the flat roof design, because he felt it was ugly and would not hold up well. He said the sloped/gable design would be better for maintenance and have a better appearance from the windows above looking down at the roof. He noted a flat roof would be cheaper and the gable roof will have a low 3:12 pitch, which is the lowest slope for this type of roof. He said although he drew Option A at the Commission's request, he was not recommending this design.

Chairman Smunt referenced photo examples of similarly styled buildings and said where a pediment is used, it doesn't dominate the façade. Mr. Marshall said he believes it is appropriate for the architectural style. Mr. Justiniano said he believes the proposed design fits better with the building and is better long term for maintenance purposes.

Chairman Smunt asked if a parapet could be used with the sloped roof. Mr. Marshall said this change would make the design ugly.

The Commission asked to review the original three options from the Façade Grant. Mr. Marshall said that in reality, you will not get the same effect as is shown in the elevations. He said the roof needs a peak to give the elevation a centerline, and without this, the building will look cheaper.

Mr. Pretz said his expectation was that the applicant would deliver on Option A that was approved by the Commission.

Mr. Marshall said that in the end, the three dimensional reality will not look as a good or have a strong street presence. He said the design is a composition rather than mimicry, and that it is compatible without being the same. He said the gable design will have a better visual preference. He noted that the triangular gable shape will be set back even with the columns.

Mr. Bobowiec said he is willing to trust Mr. Marshall's opinion based on his track record and experience. Chairman Smunt called for a motion.

A motion was made by Mr. Bobowiec and seconded by Mr. Withey to approve the COA as presented. Mr. Bobowiec, Mr. Gibson, Ms. Malay and Mr. Withey voted yes. Mr. Pretz voted no. Mr. Norris abstained. Motion carries 4-1.

7. Additional Business

a. Jones Law Office

Ms. Malay said it sounds like the Park District's final decision on a potential location for the law office is Primrose Farm, and that they will not consider Baker or Lincoln Parks. She noted that the City Council may be willing to fund a portion of the project. She said the Daughters of the American Revolution (DAR) is interested in providing a grant for the project. She said she talked with City Administrator Mark Koenen about a location on 7th Ave., at Langum Park or some other location on the east side of the river south of Main St.

Pat Pretz said she talked with Park District staff about the west side of Baker Park, but they thought this location may not work, and they suggested a cemetery. She said she and Liz Safanda of Preservation Partners met today with Mr. Koenen, the Mayor, Mr. Colby and Interim Public

Works Director Peter Suhr. She said it sounds like the City is agreeable to working on the project and the discussion focused on site selection. She noted the 7th Ave. site, located north of the cemetery, has no access from a sidewalk or parking. She said at Langum, the building would be stuck out there all alone. She is interested a potential side on Riverside Ave. just north of Illinois Ave. along the river, but some of this property is owned by BMO Harris Bank. She noted that there are other funders in the community who would take an interest in the project, including a Boy Scout project and the DAR.

The Commission reviewed GIS aerial photos of the proposed sites and discussed other City owned property in the Downtown area. The Commission discussed that the triangular grass area between Riverside, Indiana, and 2nd Aves. is City owned and could be a suitable location. Mr. Colby confirmed it is City owned but it may be in the floodplain.

Ms. Malay submitted a draft landmark nomination for the Law Office building. Chairman Smunt noted right now the building is at a landmark site, so it is protected. Mr. Colby suggested having the application ready for the new location, since the landmark status is usually tied to the legal description of the property the building is sitting on.

b. Mail Order Homes Project

Mr. Colby said the seminar is confirmed for Weds. April 23 at 7pm in the Council Chambers. A draft of the letter to homeowners is included in the packet and he asked the Commission to review. The letter will include an invite to the event. The Commission suggested rearranging the letter to first highlight that a survey has been completed, that the house may be a kit home, and to invite them to the seminar, and then follow with the section on identification. Mr. Colby will revise the letter. Mr. Colby said the Mail Order Homes window display from a few years ago is back up in the second floor atrium display window and can remain through April.

c. Municipal Parking Lot Redesign

Ms. Malay said the presentation at the Feb. 24 Government Services Committee meeting focused on the placement of the Jim Spear water garden at the north end of the green space and the Hunt Family Sculpture at the south end or the center of the greenspace. She said there is no interest from in trying to fit the Shelby Bell Tower structure here. She said the plan itself will be considered at the Committee meeting in March.

8. Announcements: Historic Preservation Commission meeting Wednesday, March 19, 2014 at 7:00pm in the Committee Room.

9. Adjournment:

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 8:11 pm.