

MINUTES
CITY OF ST. CHARLES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 5, 2018
COMMITTEE ROOM

Members Present: Smunt, Malay, Norris, Mann, Pretz
Krahenbuhl arrived at 7:03 p.m.

Members Absent: Kessler

Also Present: Russell Colby, Community Development Division Manager
Rachel Hitzemann, Planner

1. Call to order

Chairman Norris called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

2. Roll call

Ms. Hitzemann called roll with five members present. There was a quorum.

3. Approval of Agenda

Mr. Pretz requested Item #9 to read:

- a. S.S. Jones Questers
- b. Catalog Homes

4. Presentation of minutes of the August 15, 2018 meeting

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to approve the minutes of the August 15, 2018 meeting. Mr. Pretz abstained.

5. Landmark Applications

- a. 516 N. 3rd Avenue**
 - i. Public Hearing**

The Commission previously reviewed this request from property owners Will and Judith Loof. The owners stated that the current windows that have been replaced are aluminum clad wood to match the style of what was there before and the windows in the basement and garage are the original windows.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to close the 516 N. 3rd Avenue Public Hearing.

ii. Landmark Recommendation

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Ms. Malay to recommend 516 N. 3rd Avenue as a Landmark siting all criteria as appropriate. The name of the home will be The Franklin-Curtis House.

b. 515 Walnut Street - Discussion

Mr. Colby said this is a landmark nomination that was filed by homeowners Brian and Karen Graf and is being presented to the Commission for review. Positive comments were received from Commission members. Dr. Smunt requested an addendum that includes a summary about Bonnie Mitchell, a former owner of this home, added to the application backup materials. The homeowners said after going through documentation and directories as well as speaking with the County, that 1853 is the correct construction date for their home. Dr. Smunt asked the Township Assessor's Office survey date be corrected from 1875 to 1853.

The Commission is satisfied with this application and a Public Hearing will be scheduled.

c. 203 N. 3rd Avenue - Discussion

John and Donna Stockman are the homeowners. Dr. Smunt said the circa date for this home will be 1855. Dr. Smunt said this home is a remodel, not a restoration, and as a result does not display architectural significance. The sixth criteria listed beneath 3E on the Landmark Nomination form will be omitted. Commissioners stated the home was tastefully renovated exhibiting a simpler, less detailed Italianate architecture. After discussion, it was agreed that this home could be called The Burchell House. Mr. Colby will schedule a Public Hearing to recommend landmark status.

6. Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Applications

a. 308 State Avenue (Doors)

Homeowner Leslie Carroll was present at the meeting to discuss the replacement of her front door, as well as the garage side exterior door. The front door replacement would not include side lights. Both doors face the front of the home, therefore the same style door would be used in both applications.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA.

b. 103 S. 4th Street (Stairs)

Homeowner Mr. Shuki Moran was present at the meeting. He is proposing changing the front exterior stairway to treated wood, replacing stone stairs that are in need of repair. A new wood railing would also be installed to replace an unstable metal railing. In addition, a wood railing would be added to side exterior stairs where no railing exists. Mr. Moran included a photograph of what he would like the wood stairs and railings to look like from a home located at Illinois and 4th Streets in St. Charles. The improvements made at that home were approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. Ms. Malay added that she would like approval contingent upon the design that they approved for that home.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Krahenbuhl with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA contingent upon use of the design that was implemented at the home located at Illinois and 4th Streets.

c. 107–109 E. Main Street (Exterior Renovation)

Mr. Chris Adesso, Assistant Public Works Director, stated that the City purchased this building in 2012 with budgeted repairs to be conducted in phases to prepare for future tenancy or adapted reuse of the interior space. Fred Schramm, Schramm Construction and Paul Lankenau, Schramm Construction consulting architect, were also in attendance at this meeting.

Mr. Lankenau said that the wood double hung windows are in terrible shape. The intention is to replace all the windows in the building with thermal-paned, aluminum clad windows with an aluminum storefront. A door will be added on the south side of the building as well as an internal exit stairway. A retaining wall will be added to provide a level sidewalk exit at the south side of the building. The existing courtyard in this area could be built up to meet the new floor/sidewalk level. The upper bay windows in the front of the building will be restored to their original look. At this time, there is minor tuck pointing that needs to be done to the brickwork and upon removal of the ivy, additional brickwork may be needed. On the first floor, the entire storefront will be replaced and it will have the same look as it does today. Above the windows, there is a paneled space for signage that will be restored. The outside front stoop will be replaced with a ramp and there will only be one entrance into the main lobby of the building. There will be structural changes to the roof to accommodate rooftop mechanical units which will not be visible from the street. They will determine if the entire roof needs to be replaced.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA.

d. 207 Walnut Avenue (Duplex)

Mr. Colby said this is a proposal to construct a duplex on a vacant lot. Mr. Greg Derrico, of Derrico Custom Homes, was present at the meeting. Mr. Derrico said the sloping of Walnut Avenue provides the opportunity to offset the roof line. The structure will consist of deep and narrow dimensions along with roof-top use.

Commissioners stated that the style of garage doors displayed in the drawings does not offer consistency with the rest of the architecture. Dr. Smunt said this structure will have a Craftsman architectural style and that there are garage doors offering a more craftsman style look. Mr. Derrico added that the garage doors, as they are drawn, are not wide enough to be functional. The doors meet the single and multi-family City requirements of 50% maximum on the front of a building and they are set back 5 feet from the front of the building. A variance from City code may be needed for an additional 2 feet that would enable vehicles to get in & out of the garage more easily. Mr. Derrico will look more closely at the window sizes that are proposed throughout this structure.

Overall, Commission members are in favor of the design. However, they are not comfortable with granting COA approval at this point. Ms. Malay explained that they ensure that any new construction does not negatively impact the Historic District. The concerns that they have are with the size of the outside staircase and the look of the front elevation as a whole. Before a COA will be recommended, the Commission requested a streetscape elevation of other structures adjacent to this one be provided to better understand the setbacks and also to ensure this structure is not overpowering neighbors on both sides.

Dr. Smunt made a motion and seconded by Ms. Malay to table this until a streetscape rendering displaying the elevations of all buildings on entire square block is provided as well as a plat showing neighborhood setbacks.

e. 619 W. Main Street (Garage Door)

Mr. Eric Larson, property owner, is proposing the installment of two sets of carriage doors be installed to cover the existing garage doors. The current garage doors will remain intact and hidden behind the carriage doors. The new doors will swing open and the current garage doors will lift open to gain access into the garage.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA.

f. 521 Indiana Street (Pergola)

David Prentiss, property owner, would like to construct a freestanding pergola to cover the existing deck located at the rear of his home. The pergola is intended to be six inches from the house wall. No vines will be grown on it. Two ceiling fans will be in place. The posts beneath the deck are large however, Mr. Prentiss will work with Building & Code Enforcement to ensure proper reinforcement of the deck floor.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Krahenbuhl with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA.

7. Grant Applications

- 8. Preliminary Reviews** – Open forum for questions or presentation of preliminary concepts to the Commission for feedback.

- a. 619 W. Main Street (Side Porch and Side Entry)**

Mr. Eric Larson, property owner, would like feedback on potential work on a side porch. He would like to have an open porch and would remove the windows and existing door and add columns similar to what the front porch has. The Commission suggested looking into what the original porch looked like and Mr. Larson said the materials on the inside of the side porch appear to be just like the materials that are found on the front porch. Dr. Smunt said he would support going back to an open porch with columns and hand rails.

- 9. Additional Business and Observations from Commissioners or Staff**

- a. S.S. Jones Questers**

Mr. Pretz said that four times during the summer, they open up for a few hours to do tours. A \$10 donation was made to the campaign foundation. Tours are available on the third Sunday of each month.

- b. Catalog Homes**

Mr. Pretz presented literature about Catalog Homes for members to read at their leisure as well as retain for their files.

- 10. Meeting Announcements: Historic Preservation Commission meeting Wednesday, September 19, 2018 at 7:00pm in the Committee Room.**

- 11. Public Comment**

- 12. Adjournment**

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Ms. Mann with a unanimous voice vote to adjourn the meeting at 9:20 p.m.