MINUTES
CITY OF ST. CHARLES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 7, 2022 – 7:00 P.M.

Members Present: Kramer, Pretz, Malay, Kessler, Smunt

Members Absent: Dickerson, Rice

Also Present: Rachel Hitzemann, Planner
Cindy Kaleta, Administrative Assistant

1. Call to Order
Chairman Malay called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

2. Roll Call
Ms. Hitzmann called roll with five members present. There was a quorum.

3. Approval of Agenda
Mr. Pretz adding item 9a – Potawatomie Survey Update
Mr. Pretz adding item 9b – Crystal Lofts Ownership
Ms. Malay adding item 9c – Camp Kane Update

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Mr. Kessler, with a unanimous voice vote to approve the agenda.

4. Presentation of minutes of the August 24th, 2022 meeting

A motion was made by Ms. Kramer and seconded by Mr. Pretz, with a voice vote by Ms. Malay, Ms. Kramer, and Mr. Pretz to approve the minutes of August 24, 2022 meeting. Mr. Kessler and Dr. Smunt abstained.

5. Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) applications

a. 201 E Main St.
Ms. Karen Dodge presented proposal to install an illuminated wall sign on west elevation of 201 E Main Street.

A motion was made by Mr. Kessler and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to approve COA as presented.

b. 201 S 3rd St.
Ms. Rachel Hitzemann, City of St. Charles Planner, presented proposal to install a vinyl aluminum wall sign.

A motion was made by Mr. Kessler and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to approve COA as presented.

c. 320 Walnut St.

Mr. Ron Sandack, Partner at Gaido & Fintzen, LLC, presented proposal to install Trex deck flooring to replace wood on deck and back stairs and replace wood spindle balusters with straight Trex aluminum spindles.

Mr. Kessler asked for clarification if the balusters would be straight or round.

Mr. Sandack responded the spindles will be round white.

Mr. Kessler added he did not think the round baluster is appropriate for the building.

Mr. Sandack added this property was built in 2008 is not a contributing property, and read Ordinance 17-32.080 G Number 1 Significance of Sight Structure or Building.

Mr. Kessler asked why this is not a contributing property. Ms. Hitzemann responded the property is too new to have been rated in the survey. Dr. Smunt added the building was constructed after the survey had been done.

Mr. Pretz asked Dr. Smunt what architectural style this building is. Dr. Smunt advised it is Queen Anne. Trex offers a turned baluster which is a like and kind replacement. *Dr. Smunt pointed out above the balusters there is a fret rail with turned columns*. **This sentence has been amended to read,** *Dr. Smunt pointed out above the balustrade there is a frieze constructed of spindles and rails*. We are losing continuity with existing architecture. We can rule on that issue and I feel it would be better to keep to the Queen Anne Style it was built in. If you have turned fret rail elements between the two columns above the railing it's most appropriate to continue that down in the balusters of the handrail system. That's how it was done historically, and that's just good architectural practice.

Ms. Malay added we are to guide the architecture that is there and we need to continue to compliment that architecture. There is flexibility in the materials used but you still need to keep with the architecture that is there.

Mr. Sandack asked where he could find that in the code.

Mr. Sandack stated he is willing consider other options but not willing to table the COA and will not come back to present to the Historic Commission. Mr. Sandack stated he has a right to have his petition approved. If the Commission denies the petition he will ask for rational and appeal to City Council because you are not applying the code.

Dr. Smunt stated Mr. Sandack is in violation of Section 3E of Ordinance 17-32.080, Architectural Details, by removing distinguishing architectural design features. The Commission would allow the substitution of materials but the balusters should be a Queen Anne turned style baluster.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt, in keeping with the distinguishing architectural elements of this building, balusters used on the lower handrail system should remain in the turned Queen Anne style of architecture. We are allowing the balusters to be of synthetic material to be used in place of wood. A plan showing the Queen Anne style balusters will need to be submitted to the Permit Department. Seconded by Mr. Pretz with a roll call vote to approve COA.

Approved: Kramer, Pretz, Smunt, Kessler, Malay

Mr. Kessler continued discussion 17-32.080 G2 H Architectural Details states should be treated as to make building compatible with its original architectural style, character and enhanced characteristics of surrounding structures. The building just because it's new doesn't mean it's not subject to the ordinance.

d. 501 Walnut St.

Ms. Audrey Riggs and Mr. Mitchell Riggs, Homeowners, presented proposal to replace four existing windows with new vinyl windows matching other windows previously replaced in home.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Ms. Kramer with a unanimous voice vote to approve COA as presented.

6. Grant Applications - None

7. Landmark Applications

a. 7 S. 2nd Ave.

i. Public Hearing

Mr. Pretz presented landmark nomination for 7 S 2nd Ave.

The Commission discussed the style of the building being American Vernacular but the arch typifies Romanesque, the horizontal band of second floor windows typifies Prairie and the multi light windows are influenced by Arts and Crafts movement.

Mr. Pretz gave a history of the building and significant people who contributed to the development of the property.

Discussion of number 2 under Criteria for Designation, it was decided to move notes to number 1 as there is not a specific event that occurred at this site.

Ms. Hitzmann stated she received an email from Gloria Klemick who strongly supports the landmark application and feels the Idle Hour Theater will be major attribute to St. Charles and would like to see it preserved for future generations.

A motion was made by Mr. Kessler and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to close public hearing on 7 S 2nd Ave. Landmark Application.

ii. Landmark Recommendation

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Mr. Kessler to approve the Landmark Application contingent upon changes discussed during the public hearing and recommendation is made to City Council to make an Ordinance Landmarking this site with a vote to approve by Mr. Pretz, Mr. Kessler, and Dr. Smunt. Ms. Kramer and Ms. Malay abstained.

8. Preliminary Reviews- Open forum for questions or presentation of preliminary concepts to the Commission for feedback - None

9. Other Commission Business

a. Pottawatomie Survey

Ms. Hitzemann advised she had talked with Erica. She will have the completed survey data base to the City by the next Historic Commission Meeting.

b. Crystal Lofts Update

Ms. Hitzemann advised she does not have an update.

c. Camp Kane Update

Ms. Malay advised Tim Wilson had emailed that the porch is rotting on the Stevens S Jones Law Office and needs to be replaced.

Dr. Smunt stated the Commission will need a COA on the reconstruction.

10. Public Comment

Ms. Hitzemann added she received a link from Erica that she will share with the Commission on Maplink that contains a lot of information on the Pottawattamie Survey.

Mr. Al Watts commented an event is scheduled for September 24th, St. Charles in the Roaring Twenties History Crawl, which includes a stop at the Idle Hour Theater.

Mr. Watts putting together an application for Landmarking of the Piano Factory Bridge in October. He is requesting advise on what he needs to get compiled for the application.

Dr. Smunt advised the bridge was part of the industrial growth of St. Charles. It also unified the east and west of St. Charles.

Ms. Malay added a lot of the neighborhoods to the south started to be built because of bridge.

Mr. Pretz added the city was given rights of ownership, by the bank, to the bridge in 1984. Mr. Pretz advised to fill out the paperwork as best he can and present to the Commission who will then walk thru the application with him and give any advice.

Ms. Kramer found an article about the islands along the Fox River which pointed out the Piano Factory Bridge island has been referred to as Johansen's Island. Mr. Johansen was The first Superintendent of the Piano Factory and would go to the island every morning to raise the flag, and return every evening to lower the flag.

11. Additional Business and Observations from Commissioners or Staff

Ms. Malay reminded everyone needs to turn in their endangered property list.

12. Meeting Announcements: Historic Preservation Commission meeting Wednesday, September 21, 2022 at 7:00 P.M.

13. Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 8:24 p.m.