

**MINUTES
CITY OF ST. CHARLES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 1st, 2023 – 7:00 P.M.**

Members Present: Rice, Smunt, Kessler, Pretz, Kramer, Dickerson

Members Absent: Malay

Also Present: Rachel Hitzemann, Planner
Cindy Kaleta, Administrative Assistant

1. Call to Order

Dr. Smunt called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

2. Roll Call

Ms. Hitzemann called roll with six members present. There was a quorum.

3. Approval of Agenda

Ms. Hitzemann added 8b. 317 Illinois Street

Dr. Smunt asked for removal of #4 Presentation of Minutes.

A motion was made by Mr. Kessler and seconded by Ms. Kramer with a unanimous voice vote to approve the amended agenda.

4. Presentation of minutes of the October 18th, 2023 meeting

Tabled until November 15th meeting.

5. Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) applications

a. 203 N 3rd Ave.

Mr. John Stockman, owner, presented project to remove the current fence and install a new cedar fence with similar design.

Mr. Pretz asked for clarification if there was fencing that had disintegrated over time. Mr. Stockman confirmed that was correct and he would like to continue the fence to the west lot line.

Mr. Kessler asked about the post going into the ground, would it have any transition between the wood and the concrete? Mr. Stockman stated it had been suggested that the wood post be set in a post socket that would keep wood out of the contact with the ground. This will be discussed with the contractor.

Dr. Smunt asked for clarification on the existing fence being board on board and the new fence being all the boards on the same plain. Mr. Stockman confirmed that is correct. The new fence is a 1 x 4 tongue in groove design.

A motion was made by Mr. Kessler and seconded by Ms. Rice with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA with conditions that post pockets to secure the posts above grade or placing the pockets in concrete footings.

b. 15 S. 3rd St.

Bob McDowell, contractor, presented project to remove existing wood fence and replace with the same materials (treated pine in dog ear style).

Dr. Smunt asked for clarity that the fence starts mid-point on the lot line and goes west. Mr. McDowell confirmed.

Ms. Rice asked if the fence will go straight. Mr. McDowell confirmed it will go straight with a little offset to go around a Mulberry tree, then straight.

A motion was made by Ms. Rice and seconded by Ms. Kramer with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.

Mr. McDowell, asked about replacing the doors at Lazarus House. There has been some concern with security, and would like to replace the wood doors with metal doors. Mr. McDowell asked if the Commission members would drive by and look at the doors at the main entrance at 214 Walnut.

Mr. Pretz asked about the style of the doors. Mr. McDowell advised they are flat panel doors.

Mr. Kessler asked for confirmation that these would be flat hollow metal doors with insulated core. Mr. Kessler knows of resources that sell with a 2-panel design and will get information to Mr. McDowell.

c. 522 Cedar St.

Mr. Craig Bobowiec, owner, and architect Tim Nelson, presented proposal to remove the current stairs and deck in the rear of building and rebuild, including new stairs and railings.

Ms. Rice asked about replacing the pilings on the stairway on the left. Will the pilings on the center be replaced? Mr. Nelson advised the center posts will remain, as they are solid.

Commission discussed the style of the railings and material to be used.

A motion was made by Mr. Kessler and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.

d. 8 Indiana St.

Kelsey Shipton, Executive Director, Preservation Partners of the Fox Valley, presented proposal to remove the non-historic storm windows and replace them with in-kind custom African Mahogany storm windows to match.

Dr. Smunt asked about the sealing of the windows. Ms. Shipton explained the windows will be shaped to fit into the opening with a gasket on the inside.

Mr. Kessler asked how the storms will be fastened. Ms. Shipton responded they will be replaced with the hardware like and in kind with what is currently there.

Al Watts, Preservation Partners of the Fox Valley, added the windows will be replaced as money becomes available, not all at once.

A motion was made by Dr. Dickerson and seconded by Mr. Kessler with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.

e. 217 Cedar Ave.

Rachel Hitzemann, city of St. Charles Planner, presented proposal to install a traditional wood garage door.

Mr. Kessler questioned about a previous meeting where discussion was a metal door was to be installed. Ms. Hitzemann responded that the applicant stated at a previous meeting he wasn't sure that was the exact one that would be installed.

Mr. Kessler commented the door being used is a lot of maintenance and hopes they are going to be doing a lot of prep and repair work.

A motion was made by Dr. Dickerson and seconded by Ms. Kramer with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.

6. Grant Applications

None

7. Landmark Applications

None

8. Preliminary Reviews- Open forum for questions or presentation of preliminary concepts to the Commission for feedback

a. 407 S. 5th St.

Dan Marshall, Marshall Architects, Zach Derrico, Derrico Builders, and Brook Greenlee, future owner, presented preliminary concept plan of adding a 2-story addition to the back of the home and an addition to the garage making it a 3-car garage. Mr. Marshall said that they can build about 15 feet to the back of the house to get to the rear setback and adding an unenclosed porch 8 feet into the setback. Also adding the garage up to 5 feet from the rear property line. Addition will have siding, but have not chosen the exact siding yet. Potential owners would also like to add a cover over the front door and steps. Mr. Marshall discussed the styling in the addition and changes they are hoping to make.

Mr. Pretz suggested looking at 838 N. 5th Ave. to see how that home has an awning over The door. It is held up with chains.

Ms. Rice asked about the bay window in the back of the home. Mr. Marshall advised the bay window would be lost to the addition, he doesn't see anywhere to reuse it but will keep that in mind.

Mr. Pretz asked about the rear porch had 6 little windows that may be original to the porch and suggested they be careful with those as they might be worth saving and re-using.

Ms. Rice asked about page 4 of the submittal, the current house and garage side is open, but now with the addition there is no break in the space. Mr. Marshall advised the drawing being 2 dimensional is making it look that way. You will feel there is layering when built. Ms. Rice expressed concern that since the lot has already been subdivided and now adding more on to the home it changes the scenery of the house.

Dr. Smunt asked how much yard space is there between the back of the house and the lot line on the west elevation. Mr. Marshall stated from the west elevation to the lot line there is 30 feet. The porch goes into that 30 feet by 8 feet. It is an open porch. Mr. Pretz added, they are not asking for any exceptions.

Dr. Smunt asked if the front awning roof could be a less steep of a slope and secured at the belt course and held with chains.

Dr. Smunt opened discussion on the open corners on siding, using LP siding vs Hardee siding and using 3" reveal. Hardee will not warrant siding when clipping corners. Questioned using wider siding on the bottom of the addition, adding it was common in a lot of 4 squares that the reveal would get smaller on top.

Mr. Kessler reminded everyone this is a landmarked property. Zach and Dan have been respectful and shown they have been listening. Some compromise will need to be done here. The house has to be livable for modern families but for a compromise, I'm not really excited about the front piece. Dr. Dickerson stated she feels the front should not be changed.

Mr. Pretz added from a perspective I support the project for one there are no exceptions, you are staying in the bounds of what is acceptable. I have a high confidence in your ability in what you design and your listening skills. This is not to the final product but at this stage I'm confident enough that when you come back many of the things we talked about will probably be incorporated. Last thing, this is a landmarked structure, whether the structure is landmarked or sitting in the historic district they are both the same. As you're incorporating these new changes the new features and how it complements the house and neighborhood is extremely important.

Commission and future owner, Ms. Greenlee, discussed removing the screens from the front porch and other options for keeping the screens.

b. 317 Illinois St.

Mr. Greg Martyniak, contractor, presented preliminary concept of replacing siding and windows. Replacing siding with vinyl siding, same reveal, same color. Replacing windows with white vinyl windows. The shake at the top of house and the picture window in the front of the house will stay.

Dr. Smunt asked if there was a reason for replacing siding. Mr. Martyniak responded that the current aluminum siding and windows have been damaged by hail and are failing. The vinyl windows will have aluminum trim.

The commission offered suggestions for alternative color options, corner trim being 4 inch and skirt trim along the bottom of the siding. Suggested a couple of homes in the neighborhood the owner take a look at.

Dr. Smunt added the corner trim, window casings, skirt trim should all match. Mr. Martyniak confirmed the corner trim would be 4", the skirt trim would be 2" x 8", and the window trim would be 4", all would be white.

Ms. Kramer suggested making a more contrasting siding color from the trim. The cream siding and white trim does not have a lot of contrast. Ms. Rice suggested to drive around the neighborhood and look at the homes for inspiration.

9. Other Commission Business

None.

10. Public Comment

Al Watts, Preservation Partners of Fox Valley, the Elgin Watch Factory Historic District had talked of dismantling due to complaints on houses not being kept up. Elgin is working on making the MLS declare when a house is in a historic district.

11. Additional Business and Observations from Commissioners or Staff

None.

12. Meeting Announcements: Historic Preservation Commission meeting Wednesday, November 15th, 2023 at 7:00 P.M.

13. Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 9:00 P.M.