

**MINUTES
CITY OF ST. CHARLES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 7, 2018
COMMITTEE ROOM**

Members Present: Norris, Malay, Kessler, Mann, Pretz, Smunt

Members Absent: Krahenbuhl

Also Present: Russell Colby, Community Development Division Manager
Rachel Hitzemann, Planner

1. Call to order

Chairman Norris called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

2. Roll call

Ms. Hitzemann called roll with six members present. There was a quorum.

3. Approval of Agenda

The following items were added to the agenda.

- 9c. 7th Ave. Creek Project
- 9d. George's
- 9e. November 21st Meeting
- 5a. 403 S. 6th St.

4. Presentation of minutes of the October 17, 2018 meeting

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to approve the minutes of the October 17, 2018 meeting.

A spelling correction was noted on page 2, Item 7a. Frances should be spelled Francis.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Ms. Malay with a unanimous voice vote to approve the corrected minutes of the October 17, 2018 meeting.

5. Preliminary Reviews – Open forum for questions or presentation of preliminary concepts to the Commission for feedback

- a. 403 S. 6th St.**

Dr. Smunt presented a proposal for widening his garage. It will include the following features:

- Two bays wide with additional space on each side. It will be considered a four stall garage based on the square footage.
- Stairs leading to a walk-up attic that will have two shed dormers to maximize height.
- Rear elevation will have a door that leads to the back yard.
- West elevation will have three pairs of single sash, awing style windows.
- A 10 ft. covered canopy will be added between the garage and the rear entry of the house.
- Clapboard will be used on the first floor and shingles on the second floor.

He will be incorporating simplified elements found on the house into the design of the garage.

Mr. Pretz commented on the setback plan. The current garage is much further back than the proposed one. He asked if he was going to be happy with the two different styles being so close together. Dr. Smunt said he needs to move forward due to space issues.

No further action needed at this time.

6. Landmark Applications

a. 405 S. 4th St.

i. Public Hearing

Chairman Norris opened the public hearing.

Dr. Smunt suggested making the following changes to the criteria on page 4 of the nomination form.

Under III. Significance of Property:

(e), #6 check item. There are significant architectural elements on the house.

(e), #7 uncheck item. It is not innovative.

(e), #9 uncheck item. This is not an example of a utilitarian building.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Ms. Mann with a unanimous voice vote to close the public hearing.

ii. Landmark Recommendation

A motion was made by Ms. Mann and seconded by Ms. Malay with a unanimous voice vote to recommend to Planning & Development Committee approval of the landmark designation of 405 S. 4th Street noting the changes made to the application criteria regarding the significance of the property.

b. 105 N. 2nd Ave.

i. Public Hearing

Chairman Norris opened the public hearing.

There was no additional discussion regarding the nomination.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Kessler with a unanimous voice vote to close the public hearing.

ii. Landmark Recommendation

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to recommend to the Planning & Development Committee approval of the landmark designation of 105 N. 2nd Ave.

7. Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) applications

a. 113 S. 6th St. (Windows)

The Commission previously reviewed this item and conducted an on-site visit. The proposal calls for the replacement of 13 double-hung vinyl windows. Some of the original windows have already been replaced with vinyl. Dr. Smunt said it would make sense to use one consistent material. The current vinyl windows are in good condition. The windows that are remaining do have some significance. These are the two windows on the east elevation and the porch windows. Dr. Smunt pointed out that these are significant enough to warrant restoration/preservation if they were ever going to be replaced.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Kessler with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented. Mr. Pretz abstained.

b. 619 W. Main St. (Awning & Porch)

This item was previously discussed during a preliminary review. The proposal is to open a side porch and finish it with posts and trim to match the front porch. The applicant is also proposing an awning to be placed over the back door. Dr. Smunt noted the soffit is rather low and the awning may appear squeezed in.

Dr. Smunt preferred to see a close-to-scale drawing before granting approval. He would rather give approval for demolition of the remaining walls and windows so they can see what the structure looks like.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to approve a COA for demolition of the side porch walls and windows.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to table all other construction within the scope of the proposal until specific plans to rebuild the porch and awning were presented.

c. 117 N. 5th Ave. (Garage Door)

This item was previously approved, but an incorrect door was installed. Frank Florizoone, the homeowner, explained he spoke with the supplier and was advised the door would require modifications that would give it an odd appearance. The door requires customization due to its width. He was not sure what caused the mistake with the original order, but due to the time and cost involved with ordering another door he would prefer to keep the one that was already installed.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Ms. Malay with a 4-1 voice vote to approve the COA as modified. Mr. Pretz voted no.

d. 121 S. 4th St. (Shed)

The proposal is for a shed in the rear yard. The property is on a corner lot and the shed would be visible from both streets.

There was no further discussion on this item.

A motion was made by Mr. Kessler and seconded by Ms. Malay with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.

8. Grant Applications

No items were submitted.

9. Additional Business and Observation from Commissioners or Staff

a. St. Charles History Museum – Preservation Month 2019

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Kessler with a unanimous voice vote to table the item.

b. First Street Development Project & Comprehensive Plan Update

Mr. Colby provided an update on downtown development projects.

The First Street project is in phase 3. The City is starting to put together concept layouts for the completion of the Riverwalk in the east plaza that will run adjacent to building #2. The plan is to continue the Riverwalk in a theme similar to what was constructed along building #3. The east

plaza would be kept primarily open to be used for events or performances. The plan may include a scaled down water feature from what was originally discussed. This phase may include some structures that will come before the Commission for review.

Mr. Colby also said the City is looking into updating the comprehensive subarea plan for downtown. The current 2013 plan identifies catalyst sites which are sites identified for redevelopment. It lists the development that would be considered for each of these sites. The primary focus will be on the area north of the Main Street bridge and south of the railroad tracks. The City is doing an economic impact analysis of the Active River Project.

c. 7th Avenue Creek Project

Mr. Pretz said the City was granted \$1.2 million towards phase 1 of this project which consists of construction of a greenway/parklike area to relieve flooding. He mentioned this because 12 S. 8th Ave. is a project that may be impacted by this. Over the past few years the city has been purchasing properties in this area for the purpose of constructing a larger area for the creek if it floods. It is not necessarily part of the historic district at this point, but it could be if they proceed with the greenway areas.

d. George's

The Public Works department will be painting the building and asked the Commission for their input on colors. The Commission reviewed several color options.

e. November 21st Meeting

This meeting falls the day before Thanksgiving and will most likely be cancelled. A COA for a sign has been submitted that would require action within 22 days. Staff asked if the Commission would like to provide feedback now or conduct an additional meeting on November 28th.

Dr. Smunt opposes the sign because it is difficult to read. He suggested using a standard horizontal 505 on the top panel. Mr. Pretz agreed. Staff will send feedback to applicant.

The Commissioners discussed combining the next two meetings and suggested having the next meeting on November 28th.

10. Meeting Announcements: Historic Preservation Commission meeting Wednesday, November 21, 2018 at 7:00 P.M. in the Committee Room.

11. Public Comment

The applicant for item 7b. 619 W. Main joined the meeting. Chairman Norris informed him of the approval for demolition of the porch and advised him he needs to return with further drawings showing the detailed work to be done.

12. Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 8:43 p.m.