MINUTES CITY OF ST. CHARLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 5, 2018 COMMITTEE ROOM

Members Present: Norris, Malay, Mann, Pretz, Smunt, Krahenbuhl, Kessler

Members Absent: None

Also Present: Russell Colby, Community Development Division Manager

Rachel Hitzemann, Planner

1. Call to order

Chairman Norris called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

2. Roll call

Ms. Hitzemann called roll with six members present. There was a quorum. Mr. Kessler arrived at 7:01 p.m.

3. Approval of Agenda

No changes were made to the agenda.

4. Presentation of minutes of the November 7, 2018 meeting

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to approve the minutes of the November 7, 2018 meeting. Mr. Krahenbuhl abstained.

5. Preliminary Reviews – Open forum for questions or presentation of preliminary concepts to the Commission for feedback

a. St. Charles Library Renovation

Edith Craig, Director of the St. Charles Public Library, was present to discuss the plans to renovate and expand the library and parking lot.

Dr. Smunt said placing the entrance on the NE corner of the building may make it more visible from Rt. 64, but the extensive landscaping plans may actually block it. He felt people traveling on Rt. 64 were just trying to get through town and would not actually be looking at the building. Therefore, the intention of using this entrance to make the building more noticeable may not be successful. Ms. Craig said moving the entry to this location will allow them to include an

Historic Preservation Commission Minutes – December 5, 2018 Page 2

elevator for better access to each level of the building. She also noted the results of the strategic planning process showed that people did not find the current entry very welcoming. Mr. Krahenbuhl asked if they could have two entrances. Ms. Craig advised this would pose a greater security risk and staffing issue as more staff would be needed to man each door.

Ms. Craig stated the architects they are working with specialize in additions to historic buildings. Mr. Pretz felt the Carnegie portion represented the most historic portion of the library and suggested being sensitive to this architecture when considering future additions.

Ms. Craig will keep the Commission updated as their plans progress.

b. First Street Lot 8

The City issued a Request for Proposals for developers looking to construct the remaining buildings of the First Street project. Frontier Development is interested in Lot 8. Curt and Conrad Hurst from Frontier Development were present to obtain feedback on their preliminary design.

Curt Hurst said they considered the parking opportunities when they designed the building. The expected use would be for a single user office building on the second floor and a single user restaurant on the first floor. They would like to attract an upper-end tenant for the restaurant. He reviewed the features of the elevation designs. The glass parapet on the top of the building is intended to be a railing for possible rooftop use by the restaurant.

He provided examples of their materials. The intent is to use some familiar common brick as the brick element. The ACM panels would have a wood grain effect.

Chairman Norris expressed concerned over the building being built so close to street. He felt it might be somewhat tight on the sidewalk when people are going in and out of the entrance and when cars are coming down the street.

Ms. Malay said the arch area is rather empty and suggested using it for signage. The representatives hope the office user would find value in having signage in that area. Mr. Pretz suggesting re-working the arch area in a way that matches the building better. Dr. Smunt felt it didn't match any other element on the building and said it needs more to it. Conrad Hurst said when they responded to the RFP they put together a basic drawing and received favorable feedback, so they kept it. They will consider making it a little less pronounced.

Mr. Krahenbuhl asked about adding third floor office space instead of a rooftop for the restaurant. Curt Hurst said it's not economically practical to do that.

Overall, the Commissioners were in favor of the project on this lot.

6. Landmark Applications

Historic Preservation Commission Minutes – December 5, 2018 Page 3

a. 201 Chestnut Ave.

Mr. Pretz said this home represents the true Italianate style of architecture. Although it was most likely built in the late 1880's, the first evidence of its existence showed up on maps in 1892. The materials are either original or have been replicated in a way to represent the architecture of the original intent of the building.

Dr. Smunt suggested adding a supporting statement with photographs for the checklist under section III, "Significance of Property". He noted this was one of the most popular styles during the Civil War.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Krahenbuhl with a unanimous voice vote to set the public hearing date.

7. Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) applications

a. 316 S. 6th Ave. (Arbor)

The structure has already been constructed and was done without a permit. The Commissioners reviewed photographs of the existing structure. They felt it did not have any negative impact on the surrounding area. Mr. Pretz said he couldn't support the project because this homeowner should have known he needed a permit.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Krahenbuhl with a 4-2 voice vote to approve the COA as presented. Mr. Pretz and Ms. Mann opposed.

b. 214 S. 2nd Ave. (Siding & Gutters)

Steve Riedl, the contractor, was present.

The proposal calls for tearing off the aluminum siding and replacing it with traditional vinyl siding. There is currently no house wrap on the building and the old insulation is breaking apart. It will be replaced with a lifetime product. Dr. Smunt said architecturally there are some elements that should be part of this project. These include wider corner trim and window casings.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA using breathable insulation and wider $3\frac{1}{4}$ - 4 inch corner trim and casings.

c. 317 W. Illinois St. (Decks & Doors)

David Hansen was present to explain the project. The doors were cited by the fire department as inoperative. They are rusted metal ones with rotted wood frames. The replacement doors will be sturdier commercial quality doors with the same look as the current ones. The glass door

Historic Preservation Commission Minutes – December 5, 2018 Page 4

without a landing and the stairs leading to the second story both failed to meet code requirements. The decking will be replaced with similar treated lumber.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.

d. 214 W. Main St. (Sign)

The proposal is to place a sign graphic on an existing awning. The Commissioners reviewed drawings of the proposed design.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Krahenbuhl with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.

8. Grant Applications

No items were submitted.

9. Additional Business and Observation from Commissioners or Staff

a. St. Charles History Museum – Preservation Month 2019

Alison Costanzo, Executive Director of the St. Charles History Museum, discussed ideas for preservation month next May. She is planning on conducting an historic house walk during this time and would like to involve the Historic Preservation Commission. She would also like to increase awareness of the Commission.

10. Meeting Announcements: Historic Preservation Commission meeting Wednesday, December 19, 2018 at 7:00 P.M. in the Committee Room.

11. Public Comment

12. Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 8:59 p.m.