

**MINUTES
CITY OF ST. CHARLES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY, APRIL 18, 2018
COMMITTEE ROOM**

Members Present: Chairman Norris, Malay, Kessler, Smunt

Members Absent: Pretz, Krahenbuhl

Also Present: Russell Colby, Community Development Division Manager

1. Call to order

Chairman Norris called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

2. Roll call

Mr. Colby called roll with four members present. There was a quorum.

3. Approval of Agenda

No changes were made.

4. Presentation of minutes of the March 21, 2018 meeting

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Kessler with a unanimous voice vote to approve the minutes of the March 21, 2018 meeting.

5. COA: 610 Cedar St. (window & door)

Mr. Aguilera, homeowner, was present.

The proposal is for the replacement of a bow window and a sliding glass door. The window will consist of a large picture window in the center with double-hung windows on each side of it.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.

6. COA: 21 N. 6th St. (reroofing, siding on dormer)

Mr. Colby said a request for replacement of asphalt shingles is typically an administrative approval, but the proposal to replace the siding on the dormer will require review by the

Commission. The wood siding has deteriorated and the homeowner would like to replace it with Hardie fiber cement materials that have a 4” exposure. The current exposure is 3”. The Commissioners questioned the use of the wider exposure. The Commissioners were fine with the use of the Hardie board but preferred using the same pattern to match the rest of the house.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Ms. Malay with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA for the re-roof and the dormer siding changes to allow for Hardie siding and trim; the reveal of the clapboard will match that of the rest of the house which is estimated at a 3” reveal; the dimensions of the trim boards will closely match the existing which are estimated at 4”.

7. COA: 215 E. Main St. (windows)

A.J. Reineking, Public Works Manager for the City of St. Charles, and Alison Costanzo from the St. Charles History Museum, were present.

The Commission previously approved the replacement of certain windows at the St. Charles History Museum with aluminum clad wood windows with wood trim. Due to some miscommunication, the windows were installed with aluminum wrapping instead of wood. The City is seeking feedback on keeping the aluminum wrapping.

Ms. Costanzo explained the three upper windows are all original to the building. The sills have been painted over several times in different colors. Chairman Norris clarified when each window was replaced. For consistency, Ms. Costanzo would prefer to have the three windows painted black to match the newly installed windows.

The Commissioners discussed the current make-up of the windows. Mr. Kessler felt leaving the windows as is was not the right thing to do. He explained the wood window sits in the opening. It is a unit that has a sill on the bottom. Outside of that is the wood piece that is under the aluminum wrap. It could come out and another piece could be machined out of a composite material that could be inserted in that place and painted. Ms. Costanzo expressed concern over losing the tight seal the new window currently has and matching the same color black to the rest of the windows. Mr. Kessler felt it should still hold its seal.

Mr. Reineking confirmed all the previously replaced windows on the front elevation are all aluminum clad. Dr. Smunt asked about the gift shop windows. They appear to be done in aluminum clad. He said that only leaves one window in question. He felt that one new window with the cladded aluminum is more like the rest of the windows on the building, with the exception of the three original ones.

Mr. Kessler felt they should be preserving the architectural integrity of the windows. Dr. Smunt said all but three of these windows are replacements. They have lost their architectural integrity so they are not preserving any original materials. Ms. Malay said they shouldn’t necessarily make it worse. They should try to bring it back.

Chairman Norris called for a vote on the east elevation. He said they would vote window by window.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Ms. Malay with a 2-1 voice vote to approve the COA for the installation of the east elevation as presented. Mr. Kessler voted no. Chairman Norris voted no. The motion failed.

Mr. Kessler said the windows and trim are fine. He is opposed to the piece on the bottom. Dr. Smunt said the sill should be beveled. Ms. Malay stated the finish will look different due to it being a different material. Chairman Norris said he would be more comfortable using metal if they could find a beveled/sloped piece. Dr. Smunt noted water and ice will just sit on top of it without a slope. If the aluminum seam fails, they will get water in there which will cause rotting.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Dr. Smunt to approve the COA for the installation on the south elevation with a beveled edge.

Ms. Costanzo would prefer leaving as many of the windows that have just been replaced in place. Ms. Malay said with the way the edges are, they may have problems further down the road. The edges should have been sloped. Mr. Reineking asked for time to do further research on a replacement piece.

Dr. Smunt withdrew the motion to approve. Ms. Malay withdrew her second.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Ms. Malay with a unanimous voice vote to table the COA for two weeks.

8. Presentation of the Downtown Walking Tour (Downtown Partnership & History Museum)

Jenna Sawicki from the Downtown St. Charles Partnership and Alison Costanzo from the St. Charles History Museum were present.

Ms. Sawicki and Ms. Costanzo presented information regarding the proposed downtown walking tour. They reviewed the map of the tour and explained it will focus mostly on sites along Main Street. The goal is to have people explore the historic sites of the downtown area.

Ms. Costanzo asked if the Commission had a logo that could be used on their signage to recognize locally landmarked structures. Ms. Malay and Dr. Smunt suggested using an outline of the plaque with the city emblem in it and wording that states it is an historic landmark. The Commission will come up with some ideas for them.

9. Additional Business and Observations from Commissioners or Staff.

Ms. Costanzo asked if the Commission would be interested in having a member join the History Museum's Education Committee to replace former Commissioner Steve Gibson. She said if anyone was interested, to contact her directly.

Ms. Sawicki noted the downtown walking tour was approved by both Boards of the Downtown Partnership and the History Museum.

a. Discussion regarding potential changes to COA and meeting procedure.

Mr. Colby summarized a tentative proposal to more formalize the COA process, with a new application form and submittal checklist. One option to restructure how the process would work is to expand the administrative approval list. He suggested it could be varied by the types of structures or the rating of structures. Items that are routinely approved could be taken off the Commission agenda. Only larger projects that require some review would be brought forward. This could result in meetings being held just once a month or alternating the meeting dates to an as needed basis. The goal would be for complete information to be submitted earlier and to post packets earlier. It would also allow the Commissioners the opportunity to request more information and give the petitioner time to bring that information to the meeting and not need to come back to multiple meetings.

Mr. Colby said these changes would require an amendment to the ordinance so they will have to come up with specific submittal requirements for each request. The potential benefit is the Commission could have more effective/efficient meetings by shortening the discussion time and avoid going back and forth with the applicant.

Mr. Colby will bring a tentative outlined proposal of what this process will look like to the next meeting for review. If they proceed, it will need to go before the Planning and Development Committee for their direction as to whether or not they would like the ordinance amended to change the process. Dr. Smunt suggested looking at other municipalities to see their process.

b. History in Plain View plaque.

Dr. Smunt asked about the status of this plaque. Mr. Colby will check with the Public Works department for an update.

10. Meeting Announcements: Historic Preservation Commission meeting Wednesday, May 2, 2018 at 7:00 P.M. in the Committee Room.

11. Public Comment

Mr. Kessler noted April 21st is the Open Elgin historic tour.

Ms. Malay said the 8th Illinois will be at Camp Kane on April 28th.

12. Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 8:17 p.m.