

**MINUTES
CITY OF ST. CHARLES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY, MAY 16, 2018
COMMITTEE ROOM**

Members Present: Pretz, Krahenbuhl, Kessler, Smunt, Norris, Mann

Members Absent: Malay

Also Present: Russell Colby, Community Development Division Manager

1. Call to order

Chairman Norris called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

2. Roll call

Mr. Colby called roll with six members present. There was a quorum.

3. Election of Officers

Item was moved to 12c.

4. Approval of Agenda

The following items were added/changed:

12b. Status of Municipal Plaza History in Plain View plaque

12c. Election of Officers

5. Presentation of minutes of the May 2, 2018 meeting

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Mr. Krahenbuhl with a unanimous voice vote to approve the minutes of the May 2, 2018 meeting.

6. COA: 210 Cedar Ave. (fence, sign)

Karen Ramella, the petitioner, was present.

The proposal for this fence was previously discussed at the May 2, 2018 meeting. Ms. Ramella provided information on the final fence selection, a black aluminum fence. The replacement of an aluminum sign panel was also added to the proposal.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.

7. COA: 214 Walnut St. (windows, fire escape)

John Slaten, from Slaten Construction, and Bob McDowell, representing Lazarus House, were present.

The project includes the replacement of 13 windows located on the upper level. The existing windows are wood with exterior cladding. The replacement windows will match the existing finish. For safety reasons, the new windows will have the hopper on the top portion versus the bottom.

Mr. Pretz asked if the style of the windows needed to be addressed. Dr. Smunt felt the ones on the east elevation were consistent with the other windows on the building. However, the Commissioners discussed changing the white windows on the west elevation to match the bronze color of the other windows that are being replaced. There are a set of matching windows just below those that are currently covered a fence and landscaping. There are no plans to change those so they would prefer to have the upper windows continue to match the bottom ones on this elevation. Mr. Pretz and Mr. Krahenbuhl preferred to have a more consistent look by having all the windows done in the bronze color. Mr. McDowell explained there are no plans to change the color on the rest of the windows on this elevation, so bronze would stick out. Ms. Mann felt the white color blends better with the adjacent church. After further discussion, the Commissioners were fine with leaving the white windows on the west elevation.

The proposal also includes a new door and fire escape staircase located on the west elevation. An exit door will be created next to the upper windows with a landing that drops down to another landing that proceeds down to the ground. Mr. Pretz noted the City will dictate the parameters of the stairway. The Commission would only comment on the style. Mr. Staten said they could play with the rise and the staging.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented. Mr. Kessler recused himself.

8. COA: 308 State Ave. (fence)

Robert and Leslie Carroll, the homeowners, were present.

The proposal is for a dogwood style vinyl fence for the rear yard that will be connected to the neighbor's fence. Dr. Smunt expressed concerns over using vinyl materials because the home is next to a landmarked site. He felt vinyl was not appropriate for a historic district. He would

rather see them use wood or a composite material. Chairman Norris suggested tabling the discussion until the next meeting so that the homeowners could research the use of other products.

A motion was made by Mr. Krahenbuhl and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to table the COA until the next meeting.

9. COA: 203 N. 4th Ave. (fence)

Kristin Kotsakis, the homeowner, was present.

The proposal is for a 4 ft. high, black aluminum fence to go along the front and side yards. The remaining yard will consist of shared fencing with the neighbor. Dr. Smunt supported the use of a metal fence. No other comments were made.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.

10. COA: 515 Walnut St. (fence)

Karen and Brian Graf, the homeowners, were present.

The proposal is for a 4 ft. high aluminum fence to replace an existing fence. The historic gates will be reused. Dr. Smunt said it is a very Victorian era style that fits in well with the design of the home.

A motion was made by Mr. Krahenbuhl and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.

11. COA: 12 N. 3RD St. (demo portion of building, patio)

Rich Simpson, applicant, was present.

The proposal is to remove part of the building at the southwest corner to make room for approximately 750 square feet of patio space. Dr. Smunt asked if it would be possible to keep portions of the wall. Mr. Simpson said he needs to take out 14 feet of that wall in order to meet the code requirements to allow smoking on the patio.

Mr. Krahenbuhl noted the design presented looks completely different from the rest of the building. Mr. Simpson said he intends to work with an architect on a more cohesive design after he receives approval to move forward with this project. Dr. Smunt said they need to see a scaled drawing. Mr. Kessler does not support opening the roof. He would prefer to see something that

does not alter the structure so dramatically. The Commissioners stated they need further information to review. Mr. Simpson agreed to return with architectural drawings.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to table the COA until the applicant can present a draft scaled drawing of the proposal showing the floor plan and scaled renderings of the south and west elevations.

12. Additional Business and Observation from Commissioners or Staff

Rachel Hernandez and Steve Brown, tenants at 619 W. Main Street, were present. They were seeking feedback on signage. The sign would be located on the west side of the building. It is made of wood/plywood with an MDO overlay. Chairman Norris said wood does not hold up very well and suggested using synthetic materials. Dr. Smunt said the proportions look fine, but the shutters on the building are very distracting to the sign. The Commissioners discussed the graphics and suggested using bigger fonts. Ms. Hernandez will follow-up with Mr. Colby in regards to being added to the next meeting's agenda.

a. Discussion regarding potential changes to COA procedure

Mr. Colby said based on their previous discussion, they are proposing to scale back on making changes to the COA process. He noted they still may want to institute a process of having an application form with the submittal requirements. However, they may work within the existing ordinance timeframes. This might include having the deadline to submit items be the week before the meeting (on Wednesday); with posting the meeting packet on the website on Friday, giving Commissioners time to review the materials and ask questions; and sharing that with the applicants on Monday so they can gather further information to bring to the meeting on Wednesday. The current process lacks an effective way of verifying that all the materials have been received. A new process will help limit the number of items that get tabled for further discussion.

b. Status of Municipal Plaza History in Plain View plaque

The plaque has been re-installed.

c. Election of Officers

Mr. Kessler nominated Chairman Norris to continue as Chairman. He accepted.

A motion was made by Mr. Kessler and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to nominate Chairman Norris as Chairman.

Mr. Pretz nominated Dr. Smunt as Vice Chairman. He accepted.

A motion was made by Mr. Pretz and seconded by Mr. Kessler with a unanimous voice vote to nominate Dr. Smunt as Vice Chairman.

13. Meeting Announcements: Historic Preservation Commission meeting Wednesday, June 6, 2018 at 7:00 P.M. in the Committee Room.

14. Public Comment

Dr. Smunt noted the Fine Arts Show is being held on Memorial Weekend. He asked if anyone was interested in helping with the historic tour. The Commissioners discussed their availability that weekend.

15. Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 8:51 p.m.