

**MINUTES  
CITY OF ST. CHARLES  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
WEDNESDAY, MAY 17, 2017  
COMMITTEE ROOM**

**Members Present:** Chairman Norris, Smunt, Krahenbuhl, Kessler, Gibson, Malay, Pretz

**Members Absent:** None

**Also Present:** Russell Colby, Planning Division Manager

---

**1. Call to order**

Chairman Norris called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

**2. Roll call**

Mr. Colby called roll with seven members present. There was a quorum.

**3. Election of Officers**

**A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to elect Fred Norris as Chairman and Steve Gibson as Vice Chairman. Chairman Norris and Vice Chair Gibson abstained.**

**4. Approval of Agenda**

The following discussion item was added under Additional Business:

(c) 305 W. Main Street

**5. Presentation of the minutes of the April 19, 2017 meeting**

**A motion was made by Mr. Gibson and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to approve the minutes of the April 19, 2017 meeting. Mr. Pretz, Mr. Kessler and Mr. Krahenbuhl abstained.**

**6. Presentation of the minutes of the May 3, 2017 meeting**

**A motion was made by Mr. Kessler and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to approve the minutes of the May 3, 2017 meeting. Ms. Malay, Mr. Gibson and Mr. Krahenbuhl abstained.**

**7. COA: 111 N. 5<sup>th</sup> Ave. (fence)**

Lynne Smith, the homeowner/petitioner, was present.

Ms. Smith is proposing installing a 6 ft. dog-ear style fence along the back property line to match existing fencing on the side property lines. There will also be a 5 ft. wood gate by the driveway and a 4 ft. black aluminum gate between the house and the garage.

**A motion was made by Mr. Gibson and seconded by Mr. Kessler with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.**

**8. COA: 318 S. 5<sup>th</sup> St. (window & stairs)**

Jennifer Hauser, representative from Batir Architecture, was present.

The proposal includes a modified plan for the window on the east elevation. The existing window currently edges right up to the ceiling that was lowered during a previous remodeling project. The plan is to lower the window to improve the appearance of it within the house.

The plan also calls for the removal of the stairs on the north elevation of the porch and moving them to the gazebo area.

**A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Mr. Kessler with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.**

**9. COA: 109 N. 4<sup>th</sup> Ave. (garage)**

David Hansen, the petitioner, was present.

Mr. Hansen reviewed the proposal. The existing garage was damaged by a fallen tree. The homeowner would like to replace it with a slightly wider garage and shorter porch. The asphalt roof will be replaced with new asphalt roofing and the wood siding will be replaced with vinyl.

Dr. Smunt expressed concern over the use of vinyl on the new siding. He felt it would not be compatible with the current aluminum siding on the house and requested they use like materials. He also suggested matching the small window on the north elevation to the windows on the house. Mr. Hansen noted this window would not be very visible because it will be located under the porch overhang. Ms. Malay noted the homeowner may want to avoid adding more glass for security purposes. Mr. Gibson preferred the use of a nine light door to match an element on the house, or adding another window on the side.

Ms. Malay noted the home has a gabled roof line and suggested tweaking the garage design to tie into the design of the home a bit more. Including a larger overhang would also help accomplish this.

**A motion was made by Mr. Kessler and seconded by Mr. Gibson with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA with the following conditions: matching the house with like materials – profile to match (aluminum siding and asphalt shingles); including more of a Craftsman type entry door (1/3 light); window can be single or double hung; and 1ft. extended eaves.**

**10. COA: 11 S. 2<sup>nd</sup> Ave. (windows)**

Joel Slater, the petitioner, was present

Mr. Slater is proposing replacing 23 windows. The current windows are steel and are rusted. The lintels, brick work, and sills are still fine. The plan is to cut out the existing windows and add a 1x6 to provide a surface to attach the windows. The replacement windows are vinyl.

Ms. Malay expressed concern over the use of vinyl. She noted they could apply for the Façade Improvement Grant to help with the cost of using more appropriate materials. Mr. Kessler would also like to see the use of metal windows.

Chairman Norris said the alley area that is not currently visible may become part of a public right-of-way for a potential future project on the other side. This will make the area in question more visible.

Mr. Gibson said this business is located in a premier historic area and has a true industrial look. If they use vinyl materials they will completely lose that look. He suggested they compare the costs associated with replacing/repairing the existing steel windows and then look into the possibility of applying for a Façade Improvement Grant to help offset costs. Mr. Colby said they could potentially qualify for the maximum permitted grant funds. However, it would be open to interpretation as to whether or not the side windows qualify as they technically do not face the street, but are still visible and accessible.

Mr. Krahenbuhl suggested they see the cost difference before making a decision.

Dr. Smunt felt the applicant could successfully install an operable nine light window, but they will lose the industrial look. The vinyl casings and sashes will be wider than the existing steel ones. Dr. Smunt reviewed the ordinance and noted the proposal does not satisfy several components of the guidelines. He said he looked at the Hope window information and felt it would provide an excellent replacement option. He said he would support a like and kind replacement.

The applicant was willing to obtain quotes for steel replacement type windows and return to a future meeting.

**A motion was made by Mr. Pretz and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to table the item.**

## **11. Additional Business and Observations from Commissioners or Staff**

### **a. 107-109 E. Main St.**

No updates. Mr. Kessler noted the sale is public information so the Commissioners can now speak with potential buyers.

### **b. Central Historic District Survey review**

No updates.

### **c. 305 W. Main Street**

Mr. Colby advised staff received an application from *The Finery* for a potential grant project. They are looking into options for operable windows for the front façade and will be attending a future meeting for further review. Mr. Colby shared some pictures the applicant provided and asked if the Commissioners had any initial thoughts. Mr. Kessler liked the idea of open windows, but he's not sure how that would work on a structure so close to a major state highway. Mr. Colby noted there was a code requirement regarding screens. The Commissioners expressed some concern over the proposed window style.

Dr. Smunt said he would like to see a full elevation to scale showing the existing and proposed windows.

## **12. Meeting Announcements: Historic Preservation Commission meeting Wednesday, June 7, 2017 at 7:00 P.M. in the Committee Room.**

## **13. Public Comment**

Mr. Pretz spoke to John Stockman and said he is interested in pursuing landmark designation for his home. He said two others are also interested in doing the same. Mr. Pretz noted the city now has a number of landmarked sites and felt it would ultimately become a destination for those interested in seeing these buildings. He suggested having some type of city sponsored event as recognition of these sites and their owners.

Dr. Smunt suggested working with different organizations in town to coordinate some type of co-sponsored historic district/landmark tour that would include an opportunity to view a portion of the inside of these homes. Mr. Kessler said the City of Elgin recently held a tour and suggested the Commission look into what/how they organized it.

Ms. Malay noted next year will be the 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Historic Commission. She suggested having some type of celebration for those who have landmarked their homes. Mr. Gibson said next year marks the 85<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the History Museum and they would be interested in participating in the coordination of a celebration.

**14. Adjournment**

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 8:44 p.m.