#### MINUTES CITY OF ST. CHARLES, IL PLAN COMMISSION TUESDAY, MAY 2, 2023

Members Present:	Peter Vargulich Laurel Moad Karen Hibel Jeffrey Funke Colleen Wiese Zachary Ewoldt Dave Rosenberg Gary Gruber (arrived 7:30 p.m.) Chris Studebaker
Members Absent:	None
Also Present:	Russell Colby, Director of Community Development Derek Conley, Director of Economic Development Rachel Hitzemann, Planner Court Reporter

#### 1. Call to order

Chair Vargulich called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

#### 2. Roll Call

Chair Vargulich called the roll. A quorum was present.

- **3.** Pledge of Allegiance
- 4. Presentation of minutes of the March 7, 2023 meeting of the Plan Commission

Motion was made by Ms. Moad, seconded by Ms. Wiese and unanimously passed by voice vote to approve the minutes of the March 7, 2023 Plan Commission meeting.

5. Election of Officers

Motion was made by Ms. Moad, seconded by Mr. Studebaker and unanimously passed by voice vote to elect Peter Vargulich as Chair.

Motion was made by Ms. Wiese, seconded by Ms. Moad and unanimously passed by voice vote to elect Jeff Funke as Vice Chair.

Plan Commission May 2, 2023 Page 2

 First Street Redevelopment PUD-Grocery Store Sign, 300 S. 2<sup>nd</sup> St. (SDGFTU, LLC) Application for Special Use (PUD Amendment)
 a. Public Hearing

The attached transcript prepared by Planet Depos Court Reporting is by reference hereby made a part of these minutes.

Motion was made by Vice Chair Funke to close the public hearing. Seconded by Mr. Rosenberg.

Roll call vote: Ayes: Moad, Wiese, Funke, Hibel, Ewoldt, Rosenberg, Gruber, Studebaker, Vargulich Nays: Absent: Motion carried: 9-0

b. Discussion and Recommendation

The attached transcript prepared by Planet Depos Court Reporting is by reference hereby made a part of these minutes.

Motion was made by Vice Chair Funke and seconded by Ms. Wiese to recommend approval of the Application for Special Use (PUD Amendment) for First Street Redevelopment PUD-Grocery Store Sign, 300 S. 2<sup>nd</sup> St. (SDGFTU, LLC).

Roll call vote: Ayes: Moad, Wiese, Funke, Hibel, Ewoldt, Gruber, Studebaker Nays: Rosenberg, Vargulich Absent: Motion carried: 7-2

7. **Public Comment -** None

#### 8. Additional Business from Plan Commission Members or Staff

The attached transcript prepared by Planet Depos Court Reporting is by reference hereby made a part of these minutes.

#### 9. Weekly Development Report

#### **10.** Meeting Announcements

a. Plan Commission

Tuesday, May 16, 2023 at 7:00pm Council Chambers Tuesday, June 6, 2023 at 7:00pm Council Chambers Tuesday, June 20, 2023 at 7:00pm Council Chambers

b. Planning & Development Committee

Plan Commission May 2, 2023 Page 3

> Monday, May 8, 2023 at 7:00pm Council Chambers Monday, June 12, 2023 at 7:00pm Council Chambers

## 11. Adjournment at 7:50 p.m.



Date: May 2, 2023 Case: St. Charles Plan Commission

Planet Depos Phone: 888-433-3767 Fax: 888-503-3767 Email: <u>transcripts@planetdepos.com</u> www.planetdepos.com

WORLDWIDE COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION TECHNOLOGY

1 BEFORE THE PLAN COMMISSION 2 OF THE CITY OF ST. CHARLES, ILLINOIS -----x 3 4 In Re: First Street : 5 Redevelopment PUD - Grocery : 6 Store Sign, 300 S. 2nd Street : 7 (SDGFTU, LLC) Application for : 8 Special Use (PUD Amendment) : 9 -----X 10 11 12 HEARING 13 St. Charles, Illinois 60174 14 Tuesday, May 2, 2023 7:00 p.m. 15 16 17 Job No.: 473391 18 19 Pages: 1 - 49 20 Reported By: Stephanie A. Battaglia, CSR, RMR, 21 CRR 22 23 24

```
HEARING, held at the location of:
1
2
3
        ST. CHARLES CITY HALL
4
        2 East Main Street
5
        St. Charles, Illinois 60174
6
        (630) 377-4400
7
8
9
10
11
12
    Before Stephanie A. Battaglia, a Certified
13
     Shorthand Reporter and a Notary Public in and for
14
15
     the State of Illinois.
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
```

1	PRESENT:
2	PETER VARGULICH, Chairman
3	JEFFREY FUNKE, Vice Chair
4	LAUREL MOAD, Commissioner
5	KAREN HIBEL, Commissioner
6	COLLEEN WIESE, Commissioner
7	ZACHARY EWOLDT, Commissioner
8	DAVE ROSENBERG, Commissioner
9	GARY GRUBER, Commissioner
10	CHRIS STUDEBAKER, Commissioner
11	ALSO PRESENT:
12	RUSSELL COLBY, Director of Community
13	Development
14	DEREK CONLEY, Director of Economic Development
15	RACHEL HITZEMANN, Planner
16	PUBLIC AUDIENCE SPEAKERS:
17	STEVE LEFFLER
18	MIKE FLANNERY
19	MONICA EORGOFF
20	PHIL KESSLER
21	KATHLEEN FLANNERY
22	BOB ZANDER
23	
24	

-				iiseript of		8	4
1		I N	1	D	E	Х	
2							
3	ITEM NUMBER					PAGE	
4	Four - Passed					5	
5	Five - Passed					6	
6	Six - Passed					45	
7							
8							
9							
10							
11							
12							
13							
14							
15							
16							
17							
18							
19							
20							
21							
22							
23							
24							

Г

1	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Good evening,
2	everyone.
	-
3	I would like to call the St. Charles Plan
4	Commission to order.
5	Roll call:
6	Laurel Moad?
7	COMMISSIONER MOAD: Here.
8	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Colleen Wiese?
9	COMMISSIONER WIESE: Here.
10	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Jeff Funke?
11	VICE CHAIR FUNKE: Here.
12	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Karen Hibel?
13	COMMISSIONER HIBEL: Here.
14	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Zack Ewoldt?
15	COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: Here.
16	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Dave Rosenberg?
17	COMMISSIONER ROSENBERG: Here.
18	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Gary Gruber?
19	(No response.)
20	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Chris Studebaker.
21	COMMISSIONER STUDEBAKER: Here.
22	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: If you guys could
23	join me in the Pledge of Allegiance, please.
24	(Pledge of Allegiance was recited.)

1	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Thank you very much.
2	Presentation of the meeting minutes from
3	March 7, is there a motion to approve?
4	COMMISSIONER MOAD: So moved.
5	COMMISSIONER WIESE: Second.
6	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: And a second, great.
7	All those in favor?
8	(Chorus of ayes.)
9	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Opposed?
10	(No response.)
11	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: None, motion passed.
12	Item 5, election of our officers. How
13	exciting.
14	Plan Commission Chair and Vice Chair are
15	to be elected at the beginning of each fiscal
16	year, so if we just need some nominations for
17	Committee Chair and then second nomination, after
18	that we will need a Vice Chair.
19	COMMISSIONER MOAD: I move that Peter Vargulich
20	continue as our Chair.
21	COMMISSIONER STUDEBAKER: I second that.
22	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Thank you.
23	All those in favor?
24	(Chorus of ayes.)

1	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Opposed?
2	(No response.)
3	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: None, motion passes.
4	Thank you all.
5	I would now entertain a motion for our
6	Vice Chair, please.
7	COMMISSIONER WIESE: I would nominate that Jeff
8	Funke continue on as Vice Chair.
9	COMMISSIONER MOAD: I second.
10	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: We have a motion and
11	a second.
12	All those in favor?
13	(Chorus of ayes.)
14	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Opposed?
15	(No response.)
16	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: None noted, motion
17	passes.
18	Item 6, this is an application for a
19	special use requesting a PUD amendment to the
20	First Street Redevelopment PUD concerning 300
21	South 2nd Street, which is the former Blue Goose
22	property, submitted by SDGFTU, LLC.
23	This is a public hearing and the role of
24	the Plan Commission is to conduct these public

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

Г

1	hearings on zoning applications that are filed
2	with the City. All testimony and evidence, both
3	for and against this application, shall be given
4	under oath.
5	So our procedure for tonight is first we
6	will hear from the applicant who will make a
7	presentation, then we will take questions from our
8	commission followed by questions or comments from
9	members of the public.
10	After that we will take additional
11	comments at a point the public will not have
12	further opportunity to speak, so one chance.
13	When the Plan Commission feels that it has
14	gathered enough evidence we will make a
15	recommendation to the Planning and Development
16	Committee, we will close the public hearing. Then
17	the Planning Commission will discuss that evidence
18	relative to the PUD criteria and vote on this
19	recommendation.
20	The applicant will then go before the
21	Planning and Development Committee and city
22	council.
23	So before we begin, anyone who wishes to
24	give testimony or ask questions will have to be

1	sworn in, so if you could please stand, again, if
2	you are going to provide comments or testimony for
3	tonight.
4	Do you swear the testimony you provide
5	tonight will be the truth, if so say I do.
6	(Chorus of those saying I do.)
7	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: We are good to go,
8	thank you.
9	Whether it is the applicant or someone
10	from the audience, please come up to the lectern.
11	We have a court reporter, I want to make sure we
12	get everybody's comments and their opinions. So
13	please come up and spell your name, give your last
14	name, and provide your address for the record.
15	The packet has been posted on the website,
16	so everything in that packet is part of public
17	record, so as far as any exhibits or anything like
18	that are already in the record.
19	Is the applicant ready for their
20	presentation?
21	MR. HENDY: Good evening.
22	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: I am sorry, I don't
23	mean I just want to point out that as part of
24	our application Brian Moss has sent an e-mail to

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

1	
1	the planning Staff that was part of our record, so
2	everyone on the Commission has had an opportunity
3	to read that, and he had some comments being from
4	a concern standpoint related to the request. So
5	he won't be here to give additional testimony.
6	Thank you.
7	Please proceed.
8	MR. HENDY: Good evening. My name is
9	Matt Hendy. I am the contract purchaser of the
10	Blue Goose with SDGFTU.
11	Just briefly, the reason we are in front
12	of you tonight is for additional signage for the
13	proposed grocer that we are in talks with to take
14	over the Blue Goose.
15	The reason for the sign, as we all know,
16	whether you are driving on Randall Road or you are
17	driving in Oak Brook or anywhere else in the
18	country signage is a key part of any retailer's
19	success.
20	One of the first things that came out of
21	our grocer's discussions was there is no
22	freestanding signage for this 30,000 square foot
23	location. There is certainly signage on the
24	building as is typical of any development, but

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

1	
1	there is no freestanding signage. And, more so,
2	there is no signage that gets you visibility be
3	out towards North Avenue, 64.
4	So that was their primary concern in
5	making this a condition of them entertaining the
6	site, is to have a sign that can reach up and at
7	least be visible with their brand to the north
8	primarily and also obviously to the south, but to
9	have that freestanding signage expression that
10	they can use.
11	That's how we came up with the 20 feet,
12	it's not just a round number, it is actually we
13	studied it, looked at it, what can get high enough
14	that it is not too high so the entire thing is
15	visible, but at least the brand colors/the brand
16	expression will be visible out to those patrons
17	heading southbound from farther away than just the
18	neighborhood block.
19	The reason for the 1-1/2 foot high signage
20	for the grocer, as you can see here, is their logo
21	is double stacked, so it is one line on top of
22	another, and we played around with lots of
23	different sizes, but this seemed to be the one, as
24	you can see here, that fits the most

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

1	proportionally to the actual sign face.
2	We thought about where it should go. This
3	seems to be the right location, there is already
4	electric out to that general area. It fits
5	without going too far close to the roadway. It is
6	an unused area today and it fits with their
7	requirement to make their signage expression more
8	visible to patrons coming southbound and
9	northbound along the western side of their
10	building.
11	Again, here this just goes to part of the
12	study and how we want to be able to see that from
13	far away, yet you don't have to see the entire
14	sign from far away, you just get a glimpse of the
15	top of the circle, which is a brand expression
16	that they use, it is in other locations throughout
17	the country.
18	I am happy to answer any questions you
19	have. I know it is short and sweet, but I am here
20	to answer whatever questions you have.
21	VICE CHAIR FUNKE: I have a couple questions.
22	Why is it circular, is the logo their logo
23	circular?
24	MR. HENDY: It can be. In a lot of

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

1 locations it is. 2 VICE CHAIR FUNKE: Are they typically 3 circular? MR. HENDY: Every brand has got different 4 5 -- typical is a tough word, but, yes, they do use 6 circular branding. 7 VICE CHAIR FUNKE: The other question is can 8 they incorporate some materials from like the 9 building to make it look like it is similar, like the cast stone or cast block that is on the 10 building, maybe instead of using the steel as the 11 12 base they could do like a rectangular block? 13 MR. HENDY: It is a great question. 14 So I think the reason for the steel is 15 obviously structural load, wind load, snow load, 16 you don't want to have a kite that can fall over, 17 that's a disaster. When you start -- there will be some give, 18 19 like any sign does, like any pole like when you drive down the street in the middle of a storm you 20 21 have traffic signal poles, we have all seen them 22 move, there is some give there. 23 We did think about it, and when you put a 24 masonry structure around that there is the

1	potential for cracking, falling, because it will
2	have a little bit of give naturally just given the
3	size and the height.
4	VICE CHAIR FUNKE: I get it.
5	I am saying we can this looks very
6	industrial, it is very similar. I am wondering if
7	you can clad the column with the material that's
8	in front of the building.
9	MR. HENDY: Like I said, if you have
10	you will always have a steel member in the middle
11	to hold it up, and if you put something around it
12	there is always going to be a little bit of give.
13	I haven't seen a sign that is 20 feet high that
14	has got a single pole like that, I have seen signs
15	that are 20 feet up.
16	VICE CHAIR FUNKE: I am not saying going the
17	top, just the base.
18	MR. HENDY: Just at the base? Certainly
19	something we can look at.
20	VICE CHAIR FUNKE: Up to the green portion.
21	MR. HENDY: Right, that's what I am
22	talking about, up to the top.
23	VICE CHAIR FUNKE: How tall is that?
24	MR. HENDY: Great question.

1	It is eight feet, so
2	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: 12 feet.
3	MR. HENDY: 12-ish feet.
4	VICE CHAIR FUNKE: I think structurally you
5	could do that.
6	MR. HENDY: We can certainly look into it.
7	VICE CHAIR FUNKE: If the column is moving it
8	is not going to affect the stone enclosure or the
9	blocking, I think it is blocked they have on the
10	outside. I think it will look nicer and it is
11	going to relate more to the building.
12	MR. HENDY: Certainly something we can
13	take a look at.
14	COMMISSIONER WIESE: I just had a question, was
15	there something planned around the base of it or
16	is it just going to be like or are you
17	planning, do they have a typical type of landscape
18	or design that they put around the base of it?
19	MR. HENDY: There is no typical. There is
20	plant material in that area now. Throughout the
21	entire site we are going to be upgrading all the
22	plant material.
23	COMMISSIONER WIESE: So just try to keep it
24	natural plants.

Г

1	MR. HENDY: Exactly.
2	It is not going to just be sitting there
3	on its own, for sure.
4	COMMISSIONER HIBEL: How would the height of a
5	sign like this compare if put on Randall Road? I
6	am just trying to draw comparison. We are going
7	into a smaller town, quaint, charming, and you
8	kind of want to avoid the commercial look of
9	something, just wondering what the comparison
10	would be if it were to be on Randall Road versus
11	31.
12	MR. HENDY: It's a tough question because
13	we have all certainly seen signs, Randall Road is
14	Randall Road, whether you are on the highway and
15	you see those monopoles, 50, 60, 70, 80 feet high,
16	or you see monument signs that are three feet
17	high, it all depends. We are next to a state
18	highway here with buildings that flank the
19	property in several size.
20	Again, the primary reason for the
21	condition to have such a sign is so that it's
22	visible from the north. The brand wants to be
23	seen all the way out to North Avenue, so having it
24	that tall, that's the reason why. Because while

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

1	we are on a state highway we are not at the pin
2	corner, so to speak, we are talked away a little
3	bit, and so their concern is that visibility out
4	to the main drag.
5	From a comparative purpose perspective, I
6	don't know all the sign heights out there, we have
7	all seen various ranges of it, this certainly
8	isn't the tallest and it is certainly not the
9	smallest.
10	COMMISSIONER WIESE: Am I deceived or is it
11	saying is it taller than the sign across the
12	street at Kevin's or is it the same?
13	MR. HENDY: That came up at the Historic
14	Commission, I don't think anybody knows exactly
15	how tall that is. It is similar.
16	COMMISSIONER WIESE: It looks taller in this,
17	but I am trying to figure out the depth picture.
18	MR. HENDY: It could just be the image,
19	too. It wasn't intended to look taller, we just
20	didn't go across the street to see how tall that
21	was.
22	COMMISSIONER WIESE: Yours doesn't look taller,
23	theirs looks taller than yours in the image I am
24	looking at, I was just wondering if their sign is

1	closer in this picture.
2	MR. HENDY: I just don't know.
3	COMMISSIONER WIESE: Okay.
4	COMMISSIONER MOAD: I can appreciate that you
5	want visibility from North Avenue, and people
6	driving down North Avenue may not necessarily look
7	down Route 31.
8	Is there an intention eventually to also
9	put destination signage along North Avenue?
10	MR. HENDY: Well, we have no right to do
11	that and there is no guarantees that such a right
12	would ever be there. There is no intention to
13	chase that down.
14	If there was the ability to put signage on
15	North Avenue I am sure we would put it in front of
16	the tenant and they would love to take a look at
17	it.
18	As of now post this discussion and if we
19	were able to gain acceptance of the sign height I
20	don't think there is there is not a plan to go
21	and look for more signage, if that's the question.
22	COMMISSIONER MOAD: And do you know offhand if
23	this sign is taller than or equal to the Francesca
24	building that is on the other end of the parking

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

1	lot?
2	MR. HENDY: It is intended to be slightly
3	taller than the top of it, so you can see the
4	green just a little bit to the top.
5	COMMISSIONER HIBEL: Would this grocer be
6	subleasing any part of the building or is it
7	solely the grocer?
8	MR. HENDY: The grocer, they would take
9	the entire building.
10	COMMISSIONER HIBEL: Entire building, okay.
11	COMMISSIONER ROSENBERG: Question, in other
12	small downtown areas has always this grocer used a
13	20-foot sign or have they used smaller ones to fit
14	in with the two-story layouts.
15	MR. HENDY: Certainly not always.
16	In this instance being a block along, a
17	long block off of North Avenue, which obviously
18	has the most cars per day on it, that is the
19	rationale for the larger sign. But certainly in
20	other occasions they don't need such a high sign
21	because they already find themselves on the
22	dominant street.
23	Route 31 is a great street, it is just not
24	the dominant street.

1	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: How many stores are
2	in the Chicago area?
3	MR. HENDY: They have a few. I don't know
4	offhand. It is more than ten.
5	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: More than ten?
6	MR. HENDY: Yes.
7	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: More than a few,
8	okay.
9	And how many of them are in what I would
10	call modest scale downtown, modest scale
11	communities like St. Charles 33,000.
12	MR. HENDY: I think across the country
13	they have got many.
14	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: But specifically to
15	Illinois.
16	MR. HENDY: I wouldn't know, I would be
17	speculating. I don't know how many in Illinois
18	specifically to answer that that question.
19	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: And what is their
20	typical service radius? Every store has one.
21	MR. HENDY: Sure, I mean, like any grocery
22	store, it depends, some grocery stores pull from
23	10, 15 minutes away, some grocery stores only pull
24	from two to three minutes away. We anticipate

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

1	this store will pull from that 10- to 15-minute
2	drive-time radius.
3	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: So 10 to 15 minutes
4	would be what they would be anticipating for the
5	bulk of the traffic.
6	MR. HENDY: Exactly.
7	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: People driving
8	through town, need something, whatever, stop, but
9	as far as how they view our community they are
10	seeing it as a 15-minute maximum?
11	MR. HENDY: I wouldn't put parameters on
12	it. I think that is just typical, as you said,
13	not maximum.
14	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Well, I am trying to
15	understand why would you need 20 feet when you are
16	in the middle of a small downtown if your pull
17	radius is only a 15-minute drive?
18	MR. HENDY: I think it is due to the fact
19	that you have got two major state highways that
20	intersect several hundred feet to the north,
21	several hundred yards to the north specifically to
22	where the front of this building is. And the
23	signage that's currently afforded by the PUD only
24	has signage on the side of the building.

1	The reason for the amendment is so that
2	signage can be enhanced so that the visibility of
3	whomever the tenant is, this potential tenant, any
4	other potential tenant has the reach to get to the
5	dominant street, which is typical in most retail
6	developments. You want to have signage to where
7	the majority of the cars or traffic is. And in
8	this circumstance you have got only building
9	signage which is clearly not visible out towards
10	Route 64, that's the intention.
11	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: And if I live 10
12	minutes away, 15 minutes away and I was going to
13	come to this location, why would I need that sign
14	to help me find it?
15	MR. HENDY: Well, I would say that every
16	retail development, successful retail development,
17	typically has some signage package. Just on the
18	building isn't typical. Typically there is a
19	monument sign, there is a freestanding sign of
20	some point. It is just typical around the country
21	and in small towns.
22	You want to have as much signage like the
23	gas station does across the street. I think what
24	we are asking for is something that's right around

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

1	that same ballpark in terms of size sign, I think
2	our building is ten times as large as that
3	building, so we are looking to have signage that's
4	commensurate with what other successful retail
5	developments and other signage that already exists
6	on the street.
7	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Fair enough.
8	Any other questions?
9	COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: I think it is going to be
10	illuminated. Is it the intention where the whole
11	green and I guess white elements of the letter
12	would be illuminated or is it going to be
13	something like the white letters pop? I am trying
14	to understand that illumination at night.
15	MR. HENDY: It is a great question.
16	The tenant is going to be responsible for
17	applying for its permit to do the actual, what the
18	actual sign will say, it's not going to say
19	GROCER-GROCER. The intention for us is to build
20	something like a cabinet, so to speak up, there
21	and then the tenant will come in with their sign
22	face in exactly how it is lit.
23	What the details are behind how that sign
24	will be lit, it will be internally illuminated of

1	course, but how much it will be internally
2	illuminated, meaning will the green look like a
3	giant green lollipop? I think they are not there
4	yet in terms of their design to come before you if
5	that's going to be necessary. But I would
6	absolutely drill down at that point in time when
7	the tenant comes before you to show you exactly
8	how the sign is going to look at the end of the
9	day.
10	COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: I have a question for my
11	Staff, would the illumination of the sign be so
12	close to the right-of-way cause issue with the
13	code as it is now or is that something that
14	downtown has not necessarily I guess
15	asterisked.
16	MR. COLBY: We haven't observed issues
17	with this type of sign. Depending on the
18	intensity of the lighting that's used, as long as
19	it is not directly exposed it typically is not an
20	issue.
21	One other point I would add, the sign is
22	located in the Historic District so the final
23	design will have to go for a certificate of
24	appropriateness before the Historic Commission so

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

1 it will review the actual details on the 2 construction of the sign. 3 CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: If this is successful do they come back with a final design for us or 4 5 only for a COA? 6 MR. COLBY: No, it would only be for a 7 COA. 8 The zoning approval is being requested for 9 a sign this size in these basic dimensions being presented. 10 11 CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Thank you. COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: Thanks for answering my 12 13 question about the lighting. CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Anybody else at this 14 15 point? 16 We can come back after public comment. It 17 might drive some other questions for us. All right, thank you very much. 18 So anyone wishing to speak? Please come 19 up one at a time and, again, give us your name and 20 21 address, please. 22 MR. LEFFLER: Hello, my name is Steve 23 Leffler, spelled L-E-F-F-L-E-R. I live across the street from this location in Milestone Row, I am 24

#### PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

1	up on the second, third floor. My balcony from my
2	balcony I will be able to see this sign very
3	clearly.
4	And I am all for it, I want to be able to
5	go to a grocery store across the street from my
6	house, and it is one of the reasons attracted me
7	to downtown St. Charles.
8	On the stuff that was mailed to my house
9	it said what the grocer is and I drive right now a
10	half hour to that location to go to one of those
11	locations and I bypass all the rest of the grocery
12	stores in town here.
13	I would love to have this here and I think
14	you guys should do whatever is necessary to get
15	them in.
16	And that's pretty much it.
17	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Thank you.
18	MR. FLANNERY: Hello, my name is
19	Mike Flannery, and we live, my wife Cathy and I,
20	live over at 71 Cobble Stone Drive, that's
21	Flannery, F-L-A-N-N-E-R-Y.
22	We lived in St. Charles one chapter before
23	in 1997 to 2004, absolutely fell in love with this
24	community. My wife and I are not from here, we

1	
1	are from Cincinnati, and in 2012 we decided to
2	come back to St. Charles and purchase what would
3	be our future retirement home. One of the main
4	reasons is the wonderful job you all have done and
5	your predecessors in planning this community.
6	If we look around we see the architecture,
7	historic architecture, we see the wonderful
8	environment in the history all coming together to
9	create a character that is unique around the
10	country, and that's what drew us here, that and
11	the people. We have lived in other communities,
12	other states.
13	I can think and I don't know if it is
14	Whole Foods for sure, I saw it on the schematic,
15	if it's not Whole Foods I will use that as an
16	example, that's a large corporation that evidently
17	has married the local communities very
18	successfully helping the communities preserve
19	their ambiance, their environment, the way they
20	present themselves to the community without
21	corporatization of those historic communities, and
22	our experiences rely on the signage on the
23	building, period.
24	I think of Country Club Plaza in Kansas

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

Г

1	City, two of these grocers, Whole Foods in
2	Ann Arbor, also in Cincinnati, two in well-planned
3	communities, one of which is a little bit
4	difficult to see, and there are no street signs at
5	the corners, they rely on building signage and
6	their marketing communication strategies and this
7	wonderful thing, blessing and curse called a
8	cellphone, and if people are looking for retail
9	they can easily find it, they don't need the
10	street signs, so I just present that to you.
11	Thank you.
12	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Thank you.
13	MS. EORGOFF: Hello, I am Monica Eorgoff.
14	My husband, Bob Zander, and I live at 535
15	Brownstone right there.
16	We have lived in the area for five years
17	and just like the other gentleman we spent decades
18	living in Chicago so we are used to seeing a lot
19	of signs.
20	One of the key reasons, honestly, for us
21	to choose St. Charles, besides the beautiful
22	community, was proximity to a grocery store. For
23	decades we were able to walk to nine grocery
24	stores in Lincoln Park in Chicago and probably one

1	of the darkest days was last year when the
2	Blue Goose announced that they were going to be
3	leaving and we are like, I said, we better pack up
4	and move, we have got to go by a grocery store
5	somewhere. One of the best days was when I saw
6	online that there was going to be this hearing, a
7	strong possibility of a grocer coming here.
8	With all the new development downtown and
9	residential it seems like it is imperative and a
10	big draw to be able to have a grocery store, and
11	we are in total support of whatever the Planning
12	Commission and the City can do to get a wonderful
13	grocery store that is proposed downtown.
14	MS. REPORTER: Can I get the spelling of
15	your last name?
16	MS. EORGOFF: Eorgoff, E-O-R-G-O-F-F,
17	Monica.
18	MR. KESSLER: Good evening, I am Phil
19	Kessler, that is K-e-s-s-l-e-r. My wife Sue and I
20	live at 345 South 2nd Street, which is immediately
21	across from the building, and we are in favor of
22	this proposal.
23	I actually like the sign in the sense of
24	it's kind of retro design, so in a sense that you

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

Г

1	look at the metal post, and I appreciate some of
2	the earlier comments about possibly softening it
3	with masonry or something, but actually if you
4	look at the sign at Kevin's across the street,
5	which was formerly I believe a Texaco many years
6	ago, that sign has the steel posts, so it kind of
7	fits in that regard.
8	I would say, and there was some other
9	comments about the illumination and the intensity,
10	that that's something that should be looked at as
11	it moves forward.
12	Other than that I really have no problem
13	with it and, again, I am pleased to see something
14	like this moving forward, and we just can't wait
15	until something goes across the street again.
16	Thank you.
17	MR. LEFFLER: May I add just one? Again,
18	my name is Steve Leffler.
19	Every day I leave Milestone Row, I pull
20	out, and I drive front of the Blue Goose and I
21	exit what is their property, but Indiana Avenue,
22	and cross the street to go to work. Sometimes
23	bushes in the area there haven't been trimmed up
24	too much. It is kind of hard to see as you are

1	exiting westbound there.
2	My concern with doing a larger or anything
3	around the sign would be that it might block
4	visibility as you are turning. It is a good
5	distance, but you don't want it to be so big that
6	it might cause more obstructed visibility there at
7	that corner.
8	Thank you.
9	(Commissioner Gruber arrived and joined
10	the proceedings.)
11	MS. FLANNERY: My name is Kathleen
12	Flannery, my husband spoke a while ago, and I
13	would just like to add a little bit that we
14	absolutely love Historic Downtown St. Charles and
15	we have lived, as you heard, a few places and with
16	the grocery store that we believe this to be there
17	was no signage like this, and as you pull up to
18	this and where you are proposing this you are
19	practically right upon the store as it is. I feel
20	with this large sign and the Historic Downtown
21	St. Charles we don't want to be Randall Road, and
22	I just feel that it devalues the properties that
23	are around St. Charles downtown area.
24	So that's all I have to say.

1	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Thank you.
2	MR. ZANDER: I am Bob Zander, wife of
3	Monica, 535 Brownstone Drive.
4	I understand that is really all about a
5	business decision about the sign. I think we are
6	working with a company here, major retailer that
7	is very knowledgeable on what is going to be
8	successful without being annoying to any
9	residents. I am sure that's a given and they have
10	a history of doing this successfully.
11	I think the thing that I would like to
12	point out is the fact that it doesn't look like
13	the sign is going to be that intrusive and I think
14	really it is not about the sign, it has to be more
15	about what is going to drive the economy of
16	St. Charles, I think that's what it all comes down
17	to.
18	It will drive more business to the
19	downtown area, which is going to help out all the
20	other retailers in this area, and it is also a
21	very competitive industry, as you know. They are
22	taking a chance at putting something in this
23	historic area because people can drive another
24	five minutes further and go down to Randall Road

1	and see one store after another, so to have
2	something that's going to be close, that's going
3	to help out other retailers, it is going to help
4	out the residents that live here, they will be
5	driving a greater boom of people to live in this
6	area, which is going to help out the economy.
7	Thank you.
8	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Thank you.
9	Anyone else?
10	(No response.)
11	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: I wanted to make
12	sure.
13	Thank you all for your comments both for
14	and against the applicant.
15	I think at this point the Plan Commission
16	can decide if they have had enough information to
17	make a recommendation to the planning and
18	developing committee so we can close the public
19	hearing.
20	We still have our Item 6(b), further
21	discussion and determination of what we recommend.
22	Can we have a motion to close the public
23	hearing if everyone feels that way?
24	VICE CHAIR FUNKE: I make a motion to close

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

Г

1	the public hearing.
2	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Motion.
3	Second?
4	COMMISSIONER ROSENBERG: Second.
5	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Roll call on that?
6	Laurel Moad?
7	COMMISSIONER MOAD: Yes.
8	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Colleen Wiese?
9	COMMISSIONER WIESE: Yes.
10	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Jeff Funke?
11	VICE CHAIR FUNKE: Yes.
12	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Carol Hibel?
13	COMMISSIONER HIBEL: Yes.
14	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Zac Ewoldt?
15	COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: Yes.
16	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: David Rosenberg?
17	COMMISSIONER ROSENBERG: Yes.
18	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Gary Gruber?
19	COMMISSIONER GRUBER: Yes.
20	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Chris Studebaker?
21	COMMISSIONER STUDEBAKER: Yes.
22	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Myself, yes.
23	So now that we have closed our public
24	hearing we will move on to Item 6(b).

Г

1	The Plan Commission will discuss the
2	information we have gathered as relates to the
3	criteria of the PUD and any other thoughts and
4	recommendations that we have or if we have from
5	our public comment if there is any additional
6	questions.
7	Anyone?
8	COMMISSIONER ROSENBERG: I have just have
9	one question.
10	I mean, how detrimental would it be for
11	the sign to be 12 feet? I mean, that intersection
12	right there, it is such a tight intersection with
13	the buildings, I mean, you are driving, is it
14	really going to catch your eye, oh, I didn't know
15	it was there? I am all in favor of having a
16	grocery store, but to have the store, everyone
17	went there, if you didn't know where it was you
18	looked it up on your phone or online.
19	That sign just seems really large for that
20	area and I would just want to know how different
21	would it be if it were at the 12 feet.
22	COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: I think the height
23	with the visual impacts with it being taller, there
24	is less opportunity for it to be impacting on

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

Г

1	drivers 31 and other intersections from all the mass
2	of the sign.
3	COMMISSIONER ROSENBERG: As far as a blind spot?
4	COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: Yes. So with it being
5	higher the actual sign itself is elevated outside
6	of the line of sight. If you lowered it even if
7	they reduced the size of the box, what's allotted
8	12 foot, I think that would be more of an
9	obstruction than this in that case from a visual
10	standpoint.
11	COMMISSIONER STUDEBAKER: The gentleman said
12	that section of bush when you are trying to pull
13	out of that on Indiana when it gets tall you can't
14	see, so if it was lower I agree 100%, it would
15	actually be more of a deterrent.
16	COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: And in theory a 12-foot
17	sign could go there, that's larger, wider, more of
18	a base rather than a pole sign, so from a design
19	standpoint the balance might be better from a
20	safety perspective and visibility perspective, I
21	think you are balancing, you know that's my
22	opinion on that.
23	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: I would offer that
24	the sign is not close to Indiana, the sign is on

Г

1	the northwest corner of the property, so it is not
2	next to the driveways. This has no influence on
3	site visibility from Indiana at all.
4	COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: It would be for Chestnut
5	driveway, so there would be some applications
6	for the neighbor if it was lower.
7	COMMISSIONER MOAD: If somebody turns.
8	COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: Just consider what is
9	around there.
10	COMMISSIONER WIESE: I was going to say I
11	actually appreciate this is what I would consider
12	a minimalist sign, I like that it is just the pole
13	because I think it makes it not as obtrusive and
14	not as obstructive, and considering I am looking
15	at the sign right across the street at the very
16	least appears as tall, if not taller, and I don't
17	see that as kind of impeding the downtown or
18	taking away from downtown.
19	I can appreciate that retail is a tough
20	business so I can understand, I mean, I don't know
21	all the parameters that go into what this grocer
22	considers in the pole and that all makes sense,
23	but I also understand retail is a tough business,
24	so I want it to be successful and I want it to

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

Г

1	pull as many people as it can because I think as
2	the gentleman spoke the more people that come to
3	this the better it is for our community, better it
4	is for the businesses or restaurants, but I also
5	think the design is simplistic and minimal, and I
6	like that, I like that it is not super impactful
7	in terms of taking away from the landscape or the
8	vision of that area personally.
9	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: A quick question.
10	In building a sign that met our ordinance
11	how far away does it have to be setback from the
12	right-of-way, five feet or ten feet? Or I guess
13	it is a PUD, but
14	MR. COLBY: The setback requirement would
15	be 10 feet. It is only permitted from the line of
16	zoning to be 12 feet tall, so it is a shorter
17	sign, so part of the setback requirement is for
18	the visibility impacts.
19	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Thank you.
20	VICE CHAIR FUNKE: I would say that I think
21	the reason why they are doing 20 feet is because
22	the building, Francesca's new restaurant, is
23	probably 15 or 16 feet to the top of the parapet,
24	what that means is coming from North Avenue if you

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

Γ

1	have a 12-foot sign or even 14-foot sign you are
2	not going to be able to see it.
3	So, I mean, being an architect I think the
4	studies show you are trying to pull people in from
5	North Avenue, I think it is an important thing,
6	because the site is set back, right, and it is
7	hard to see the sign. You can see it here in the
8	picture they show that the signage on the building
9	is blocked by the trees, the landscaping that they
10	have.
11	I am actually for if because I think it
12	will help the business and with all the traffic
13	that we have on North Avenue I think they need it,
14	to be honest with you, a couple architectural
15	things here and there, but all in all I think it
16	will be very helpful and it would help the
17	business thrive.
18	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Gary?
19	COMMISSIONER GRUBER: I am in favor it is going
20	to make it successful. I am in favor of anything
21	that is going to be enabling them to be successful
22	in the investment in that part of the city, and I
23	don't think it is that obtrusive to the property,
24	and I think the ability to draw off North Avenue

```
1
     is critical to their success so I would be in
2
     favor.
3
            CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: On this application
4
    and if it is an amendment to the PUD, so with an
5
    amendment to the PUD this approval rides with the
6
    property, not unique to this applicant, not unique
7
    to this store, is that right?
8
           MR. COLBY: Correct. It is specific to
9
    this lot.
10
           CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Right.
11
           MR. COLBY: Where it is requested, only
    permitted on the single sign on this lot.
12
13
            CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: But if this is
14
    approved and they go away then whoever comes next
15
    can use this approval.
16
           MR. COLBY: Correct. The sign could be
17
    reused, the face could be changed.
           CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: So this isn't a
18
19
    unique approval just for this potential client or
20
    potential.
21
           MR. COLBY: It is specific to the
22
    property.
23
           CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Correct. Thank you.
24
           COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: Just to add one thing,
```

Г

1	for this user from an east-west perspective, it is
2	one-foot wide, so that the actual visual impact
3	from someone looking from east towards the west
4	towards the river they wouldn't be impacted as
5	much as someone driving along the road, grab
6	attention, so I think it is important also, it is
7	not going to be too obtrusive from all the
8	residences, it mostly focuses on 31 and
9	North Avenue grabbing that attention.
10	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Any further
11	discussion, questions, we have any additional
12	questions for our applicant?
13	COMMISSIONER ROSENBERG: No, just a comment,
14	kind of a general concern, we make the exception
15	for this one or something else, are we going to
16	make exceptions for other signs up and down
17	Route 31 and then we are looking not like it does
18	now, just a concern I have.
19	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: It is fair,
20	absolutely.
21	COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: I think this site presents
22	unique characteristics.
23	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: It is an amendment to
24	a unique PUD. It isn't a gross change or a

1	generalized change to our signage ordinance.
2	COMMISSIONER ROSENBERG: I agree, but someone
3	else will say you approved this one
4	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: And there are future
5	properties that could be redeveloped to the north
6	of North Avenue, as you go north there is a
7	parking lots and other properties to the north,
8	and so depending on how that is assembled and how
9	it is, there is no application, but that could be
10	part of it. It is hard to say. It is hard to
11	say.
12	COMMISSIONER MOAD: Every property is considered
13	individual.
14	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Only in a PUD
15	application.
16	COMMISSIONER GRUBER: To Dave's question, there
17	is no precedent that would be set, so anything
18	that would be in addition along that line would
19	still have to go through this process.
20	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: So with that is there
21	anything that we have additional questions from
22	Staff before we get to some of our procedures?
23	Rachel, anything, everybody is good?
24	Thank you again for that application

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

1	review. So at this point we would looking for a
2	motion of this application.
3	VICE CHAIR FUNKE: I will make a motion, I
4	will make a motion for verbal for the First Street
5	Redevelopment PUD grocery store sign 300 South 2nd
6	Street SDGFTU, LLC application for special use.
7	COMMISSIONER WIESE: Second.
8	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Motion and a second.
9	Is there any discussion on the motion?
10	And I would just offer since from here we
11	will not see this again, assuming it moves forward
12	and goes through the process of application, the
13	only group that will see this again will be
14	Historic Preservation for a COA.
15	Is there any thought on some of the
16	questions that Zac mentioned about lighting, do we
17	feel like do we want to put any restriction from
18	our view as an example to the green portion of the
19	sign is not illuminated, it is only the letters
20	illuminated, anything like that? Just asking that
21	question before we finish the motion.
22	VICE CHAIR FUNKE: Are there not lighting
23	ordinance requiring them to maintain certain
24	lumens?

1	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Yes, yes. But I
2	guess the question becomes do you want to see the
3	entire green be illuminated on it or just the
4	white part, whatever it said, whatever those
5	letters end up being, not GROCER-GROCER.
6	COMMISSIONER MOAD: I think I would have to
7	understand what the brand's logo is in order to
8	even make a comment.
9	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Well, they are not
10	sharing it.
11	COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: I think we get the point.
12	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: I think we can guess.
13	COMMISSIONER MOAD: In terms of what lumen
14	standards are.
15	COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: I think we can trust Staff
16	in the COA process, that boards has its purpose, I
17	think we can trust them.
18	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: That's fine. I just
19	wanted to ask that before we complete our process
20	here.
21	So we have a motion and that motion is
22	that the application for special use requesting a
23	PUD amendment from the First Street Redevelopment
24	PUD concerning 300 South 2nd Street, which is the

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

1	former Blue Goose property, and submitted by
2	SDGFTU, LLC, for approval, are we still good on
3	that?
4	Rollcall.
5	Laura Moad?
6	COMMISSIONER MOAD: Yes.
7	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Colleen Wiese.
8	COMMISSIONER WIESE: Yes.
9	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Jeff Funke?
10	VICE CHAIR FUNKE: Yes.
11	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Karen Hibel?
12	COMMISSIONER HIBEL: Yes.
13	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Zac Ewoldt?
14	COMMISSIONER EWOLDT: Yes.
15	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: David Rosenberg?
16	COMMISSIONER ROSENBERG: No.
17	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Gary Gruber?
18	COMMISSIONER GRUBER: Yes.
19	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Chris Studebaker?
20	COMMISSIONER STUDEBAKER: Yes.
21	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Myself, no.
22	Motion passes. Thank you very much.
23	Thank you for the public for
24	participation.

1	So now we are at the point where there is
2	any public comment just in general? Anything to
3	share?
4	(No response.)
5	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: No.
6	Additional business from the planning
7	commission or members of Staff? Anything, Russ or
8	Rachel?
9	Will we with a meeting on the 16th or
10	whatever it is or yet to be determined?
11	MS. HITZEMANN: Still to be determined.
12	We have a PUD preliminary planning meeting
13	for revised plans before we schedule a date.
14	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: I just have a
15	question for Staff, is there any general
16	information about the consultant selection related
17	to the downtown parking study or the police
18	station feasibility study?
19	MR. COLBY: The downtown parking study we
20	issued an RFP and we received responses and we
21	have reviewed those, so expecting to present our
22	recommendation for the consultant in the next
23	coming months.
24	The discussion regarding the police

Г

1	station site and possible RFP we need to return
2	back to the Planning and Development Committee
3	with a scope to have the committee review that
4	scope and provide direction on how to proceed with
5	issuing RFP for that.
6	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: So the RFP on the
7	police station site study feasibility study is
8	still yet coming, so you haven't issued that out?
9	MR. COLBY: Correct. It needs to be
10	presented to the Planning and Development
11	Committee for direction.
12	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: And department
13	studies in general, how many people responded to
14	that to our RFP?
15	MR. COLBY: Four responses.
16	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Okay, good, all
17	right. And we might get the decision in
18	a couple months?
19	MR. COLBY: Yes.
20	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: Okay, great.
21	COMMISSIONER WIESE: Do you know how long the
22	study will last, do they give those parameters or
23	different for each one depending on who you pick?
24	MR. COLBY: I think it varies, but do I

## PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM

1	think we are hoping to have the study completed by
2	later this year.
3	COMMISSIONER WIESE: By this year?
4	MR. COLBY: Yes, late in this calendar
5	year.
6	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: So we may have a
7	meeting on the 16th, stay tuned, you will get an
8	e-mail. Is there a motion for
9	adjournment?
10	COMMISSIONER ROSENBERG: So moved.
11	COMMISSIONER WIESE: Second.
12	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: All in favor?
13	(Chorus of ayes.)
14	CHAIRMAN VARGULICH: St. Charles Planning
15	Commission complete at 7:50 p.m.
16	(End of meeting.)
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	

STATE OF ILLINOIS ) 1 SS. ) 2 COUNTY OF DUPAGE ) 3 4 I, STEPHANIE A. BATTAGLIA, do hereby 5 certify that I reported in shorthand the 6 proceedings had at the meeting aforesaid, and that 7 the foregoing is a true, complete, and accurate transcript of the proceedings at said meeting as 8 9 appears from my stenographic notes so taken and transcribed under my personal direction, this 9th 10 11 day of May, 2023. 12 13 logue 14 15 Certified Shorthand Reporter 16 17 18 CSR No. 084-003337 - Expires May 31, 2023 19 20 21 22 23 24