

MINUTES
CITY OF ST. CHARLES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY, JUNE 6, 2018
COMMITTEE ROOM

Members Present: Pretz, Malay, Krahenbuhl, Kessler, Smunt, Norris, Mann

Members Absent: None

Also Present: Russell Colby, Community Development Division Manager

1. Call to order

Chairman Norris called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

2. Roll call

Mr. Colby called roll with seven members present. There was a quorum.

3. Approval of Agenda

No changes were made.

4. Presentation of minutes of the May 16, 2018 meeting

A motion was made by Mr. Krahenbuhl and seconded by Mr. Kessler with a unanimous voice vote to approve the minutes of the May 16, 2018 meeting. Ms. Malay abstained.

5. COA: 619 W. Main St. (signs)

The proposal is for the installation of two wall signs that were previously discussed at the last meeting.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA.

6. COA: 215 E. Main St. (windows)

A.J. Reineking, Public Works Manager for the City of St. Charles, was present.

A revision to the approved COA was discussed at a previous meeting; however, the Commission asked the applicant to return with a design that would provide a beveled edge sill on the

windows. Mr. Reineking presented new designs showing an aluminum beveled edge that adds the architectural detail back to the windows.

Mr. Kessler expressed concerns over the use of the aluminum cover piece without knowing how the sill was constructed. Mr. Reineking will take another look at it with the contractor; he noted an issue with one of the aluminum sills that had been damaged. Dr. Smunt said that would be a structural element to be reviewed by the building department; the Commission should decide on the architectural improvements presented. If changes need to be made based on the findings of the building inspector, then this would need to come back before the Commission.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Dr. Smunt with a 5-1 voice vote to approve the COA as presented. Mr. Kessler voted no.

7. COA: 316 S. 6th Ave. (pergola)

This item did not contain enough information to be included in the review packet. Mr. Colby advised that it be tabled, pending submittal of further information.

A motion was made by Dr. Smunt and seconded by Ms. Malay with a unanimous voice vote to table the COA until the next meeting.

8. COA: 17 N. 5th St. (addition, siding/windows, detached garage)

Guy Cameron, the homeowner and contractor, was present.

The proposal is for renovations to be made to an existing house, an addition to be built in the rear, and construction of a new detached garage.

The existing materials on the house are aluminum siding and aluminum storm windows over wood windows. The proposal includes the following changes and materials:

- New siding using LP Smartsiding with 4” trim corner boards and frieze board.
- Reconstruction of the roof structure. The architect thought it would look better/wider if the hip was on the other side.
- Replacement of windows.
- Construction of a one story addition in the rear using board-and-batten LP Smartsiding.
- No changes to the front porch.

Dr. Smunt said the roof and dormer were appropriate for the home and questioned why these were being changed. Mr. Cameron felt the dormer looked oversized and noted the current framing has a 6” flat valley that looks bad.

Dr. Smunt felt the existing horizontal clapboard was the only defining element that can be carried through to the addition. He said board-and-batten was not used on any historical homes in the past. He read the following excerpt from the ordinance for certificates of appropriateness:

G.2.h. Architectural details, including types of materials, colors and textures, should be treated so as to make a building compatible with its original architectural style and character, and to enhance the inherent characteristics of the surrounding structures.

Dr. Smunt noted the use of board-and-batten siding on the addition does not comply with this section of the ordinance. In addition, he noted the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation state:

G.3.c. All buildings, structures or sites shall be recognized as physical records of their own time, place and use. Alterations that have no historical basis, or which seek to create an earlier appearance, shall be avoided.

Dr. Smunt felt there was no historical basis for the use of board-and-batten siding. It does not comply with this section.

G.3.e. Distinctive stylistic features, finishes and construction techniques or examples or skilled craftsmanship, which characterizes a building, structure or site, shall be preserved.

The use of clapboard siding on the addition will preserve the distinctive stylistic features, finishes and construction techniques of the original structure, whereas board-and-batten siding does not comply with this section. Dr. Smunt felt they were changing an element out of the context of when the house was built.

Mr. Cameron said the only place the siding will be visible from the front, other than the dormer, will be a 6 ft. section that will have a door within it. Board-and-batten is currently on other parts of the house.

Ms. Malay was fine with the roof changes and the siding, but expressed concerns over the amount of vertical siding included in the new design.

The garage will have board-and-batten siding. Dr. Smunt pointed out that garages were out buildings made with board-and-batten. He said they could be more flexible with the garage.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a 5-1 voice vote to approve the COA as presented, but with no changes to the front porch. Dr. Smunt voted no.

9. Additional Business and Observation from Commissioners or Staff

Ms. Malay provided an update from the Downtown St. Charles Partnership board meeting. They are reviewing the possibility of combining work efforts with the St. Charles Convention and Visitor Bureau.

a. Discussion regarding potential changes to COA and meeting procedure

No updates.

10. Meeting Announcements: Historic Preservation Commission meeting Wednesday, June 20, 2018 at 7:00 P.M. in the Committee Room.

11. Public Comment

None.

12. Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 8:15 p.m.