

	HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION AGENDA ITEM EXECUTIVE SUMMARY			
	Agenda Item Title/Address:	Discussion Regarding Comprehensive Plan Structures		
	Proposal:			
	Petitioner:	City of St. Charles		
Please check appropriate box (x)				
	PUBLIC HEARING		MEETING 6/5/19	X
AGENDA ITEM CATEGORY:				
	Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)		Façade Improvement Plan	
	Preliminary Review		Landmark/District Designation	
X	Other Commission Business		Commission Business	
ATTACHMENTS:				
Comment Sheet				
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:				
Staff has compiled the comments made in response to the Comprehensive Plan Property review discussion that occurred at the 5/1/19 meeting.				
RECOMMENDATION / SUGGESTED ACTION:				

Historic Commission recommendations regarding existing structures in the Comprehensive Plan Study Area

DRAFT- June 5, 2019

General Comments:

- Buildings rated as “Significant” or “Contributing” should be preserved as a part of the Historic District.
- Buildings rated as “Contributing” could be considered for removal based on plans for the replacement structure, and the removal and replacement structures need to be reviewed concurrently. In general, the replacement building should meet or exceed the value of the existing Contributing building in terms of architectural contribution to the Historic District.
- Buildings rated as “Non-Contributing” could potentially be removed without affecting the integrity of the Historic District; however consideration of each structure is necessary to verify whether there is concealed architectural significance or undocumented historical significance.

The significance ratings shown the maps of the study area are appropriate, subject to the following considerations:

East Side:

1. The Radium Removal building (250 N. Riverside Ave.) was not previously rated- it is rated as “Contributing”.
2. The easterly portion of the Police Station building (10 State Ave.) is rated as “Non-Contributing”. This structure could be proposed for demolition without a replacement structure being proposed concurrently.
3. The westerly portion of the Police Station adjacent to the river (2 State Ave.) was rated as “Non-Contributing” in the Architectural Survey. However, the building classification is raised to “Contributing” based on the following:
 - a. Distinctive design that is compatible with the site and relates to the Municipal Building (roof design)
 - b. Low profile, pedestrian scale and proportion that relates to the riverscapeHistoric Commission would not recommend considering demolition of the building without concurrent review of a replacement structure.

West Side:

1. 316 & 322 Cedar Street (Johnson’s Statuary): Structures are Greek Revival Limestone buildings dating from the 1840s-1850s. Ratings for the original two-story portions of each structure are to be raised from “Contributing” to “Significant” based on Architectural Significance. The rear additions and garage structures appear to be non-contributing elements.
2. 226 State Street: Prairie Foursquare building located at the north end of 3rd Street. This structure is to be raised from “Contributing” to “Significant” based on Architectural Significance.