

**MINUTES
CITY OF ST. CHARLES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 16, 2013
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM**

Members Present: Chairman Smunt, Bobowiec, Pretz, Withey

Members Absent: Norris

Also Present: Russell Colby, Planning Division Manager

1. Call to order:

Chairman Smunt called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm.

2. Roll call:

Chairman Smunt called roll with four members present. There was a quorum.

3. Approval of the agenda:

No changes or additions.

4. Presentation of minutes from October 2, 2013 meeting.

A motion was made by Mr. Bobowiec and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to approve the minutes as presented.

5. COA: 323 Illinois St. (doors and windows)

Erika Przybylinski, applicant, was present. She stated she is requesting to replace four wood entry doors and two wood windows located in the kitchen. All of the proposed doors are fiberglass and the proposed windows are vinyl.

Chairman Smunt noted the existing doors do not appear to be original. Ms. Przybylinski agreed, and stated that most of them appear to be replacements from the 1990s. She noted that the house has a mix of different materials inside that a previous owner installed, including vinyl double hung windows installed in approximately 1997.

Chairman Smunt noted the proposed front door style is appropriate for the house, he asked if she considered using this style on the other doors. Ms. Przybylinski stated that she wanted to keep the open glass windows on the side doors, but that the back door might be able to match the front door design, although it will require a custom size.

Chairman Smunt asked about storm doors. Ms. Przybylinski said she will be replacing the storm doors and referred to information in the packet showing a full view storm door with a single meeting rail. Chairman Smunt stated he thought the replacements were all appropriate, noting that fiberglass looks just like wood. Ms. Przybylinski stated the fiberglass will have a wood grain texture and she would look into having the south door replicate the style of the north door.

The Commission moved on to discuss the window replacements. Chairman Smunt asked about the proposed grills on the windows. Ms. Przybylinski referred to the information in the packet showing the grills will match the existing pattern and will be located on the outside of the glass as well. She said the slider window will replicate the same grill pattern of the existing fixed window.

The Commission agreed the proposal was appropriate for the building.

A motion was made by Mr. Withey and seconded by Mr. Bobowiec with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA.

6. COA & Façade Improvement Grant: 213 S. 3rd St. (siding)

David Saelens, applicant, and contractor John Garelli, Garelli Siding and Roofing, were present.

Chairman Smunt noted that the Commission had conducted a site visit back in June and observed that much of the wood shingle siding on the house was significantly deteriorated. He noted there was a proposal for either cedar or fiber cement siding replacement and a Façade Grant request to assist with funding the project.

Mr. Saelens stated his preference is for the Hardie fiber cement siding. Mr. Garelli presented the proposal to match the existing architecture and replace the siding with fiber cement shake shingles, crown molding, and horizontal siding (smooth face out). The existing porch railings would be reconstructed with wood to match the existing. The soffits and brackets on the building would be scraped and painted, not replaced.

Mr. Garelli asked the Commission about using fiber cement for the casings. He indicated that casings can be built to exact existing size. The Commission supported using the fiber cement casing.

Chairman Smunt asked about the cost difference between cedar and fiber cement. Mr. Garelli stated that cedar material cost is more expensive, but some contractors consider fiber cement a specialty and charge more for the product installation.

Chairman Smunt asked about the corners and said the Commission would prefer use of a metal edging at the corners to match the existing siding rather than a corner board. Mr. Garelli agreed this could be done and he has used this method previously.

The Commission asked about replacing the soffits. Mr. Garelli stated they could be replaced with a flat fiber cement panel. The Commission agreed with including this in the project.

Mr. Saelens mentioned they considered replacing the front porch columns with a boxed column. Chairman Smunt said architecturally, either would work, but the Commission would prefer the original column be retained. He suggested venting the top and bottom.

Mr. Saelens said he might replace the awning fabric at some point, but the awning structure will remain. Mr. Colby said recovering the awning can be approved as an administrative approval without appearing before the Commission.

The Commission was supportive of the project. Mr. Pretz thanked Mr. Garelli for attending and presenting the proposal in detail and stated it was very beneficial to have the contractor present to explain this type of project.

A motion was made by Mr. Pretz and seconded by Mr. Withey with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA.

A motion was made by Mr. Bobowiec and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a unanimous voice vote to recommend to the City Council approval of the Façade Improvement Grant application.

7. Additional Business

Ms. Przybylinski, 323 Illinois St., asked the Commission questions about other projects on her house. She asked about replacing the roof. Mr. Colby stated replacing an asphalt shingle roof with a new asphalt shingle roof can be approved administratively. Ms. Przybylinski asked the Commission for input on her front porch, which she noted is sloping off of the house due to an inadequate foundation. She questioned how she should approach this in terms of correcting the issue and what type of contractor to contact. The Commission discussed that she should contact a regular general contractor first to analyze the issue and determine how the porch is attached to the house. The contractor may want to entirely or partially remove the porch to install a foundation. Fixing the foundation issue with the porch in place may be difficult and labor intensive. The Commission suggested Ms. Przybylinski consult further with the Commission after she consults with some contractors. Mr. Colby will send her contacts for contractors.

Chairman Smunt noted that two candidates for the Commission vacancies were present, Stephen Gibson and Kim Malay. He said the Mayor intends to nominate Mr. Gibson. Mr. Gibson introduced himself and provided information on his background. Mr. Bobowiec asked if the Commission should recommend the appointments as a group. Chairman Smunt said that was not the Commission's place to do so, rather the Mayor suggested providing input from individual Commission members. He suggested the members contact the Mayor. Mr. Bobowiec noted he is concerned with keeping the seats open as it creates a potential quorum issue when members can't attend.

Mr. Pretz summarized the Preservation Partners house tour which took place on Oct. 6 and included three St. Charles landmark buildings. Chairman Smunt attended and enjoyed the tours.

8. Announcements: Historic Preservation Commission meeting Wednesday, November 6, 2013 at 7:00pm in the Committee Room.

9. Adjournment:

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 7:55 pm.

Respectfully submitted,
Dr. Steven Smunt, Chairman
St. Charles Historic Preservation Commission