

**MINUTES
CITY OF ST. CHARLES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY, MAY 6, 2015
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM**

Members Present: Chairman Smunt, Bobowiec, Malay, Pretz, Gibson, Norris

Members Absent: Withey

Also Present: Russell Colby, Planning Division Manager
Ellen Johnson, Planner

1. Call to order

Chairman Smunt called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

2. Roll call

Chairman Smunt called roll with five members present. There was a quorum. Mr. Norris arrived at 7:02 p.m.

3. Approval of the agenda

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Gibson with a unanimous voice vote to move item #4 Election of Officers to item #12.c.

5. Presentation of minutes of the April 15, 2015 meeting

A motion was made by Mr. Bobowiec and seconded by Ms. Malay with a unanimous voice vote to approve the minutes.

6. COA: 105 S. 4th Ave. (siding)

Mr. Colby showed a picture of the building. He said the existing aluminum siding will be replaced with horizontal vinyl siding. No changes to the window casings are proposed.

Chairman Smunt asked how wide the existing aluminum siding is. Manny from Vinyl Tech was present. He said the existing siding is 8 in. and proposed is double 4 in. Chairman Smunt said what is proposed is more historically accurate. Manny said 4 in. vinyl corner boards will be used.

Mr. Pretz asked about the shutters. Manny said they will be removed and replaced. Chairman Smunt suggested keeping the shutters off because there is no historical basis for shutters on the Craftsman style four-square; shutters do not match the architecture.

A motion was made by Mr. Bobowiec and seconded by Ms. Malay with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA, with a recommendation that the shutters be permanently removed.

The owner of the property inquired about future replacement of the gutters and soffit. He said the existing soffit is wood and the gutters are steel and aluminum. Manny said the existing gutters would be replaced with a seamless aluminum gutter. The soffit would be covered with a maintenance free material.

Chairman Smunt said half round aluminum gutters would be appropriate, with aluminum hangers, hung under the shingles. Mr. Pretz said those gutters would enhance the architecture compared to what is there.

A motion was made by Mr. Bobowiec and seconded by Ms. Malay with a unanimous voice vote to amend the previous motion to approve the COA to include approval of replacement of the gutters with half round aluminum gutters and the soffit with aluminum.

7. COA: 101-111 S. 1st St. (signs)

Mr. Colby said signs and lighting are proposed for Starbucks, which is locating in the First Street Plaza building.

Phil Golding, representative from Starbucks, said the Starbucks on E. Main St. is relocating to First Street.

Bob Rasmussen, building owner, said the 101 S. 1st St. façade storefront will be painted black to match the 111 S. 1st St. façade. The Starbucks logo will be placed on the 101 S. 1st St. façade and the Starbucks name will be placed on the 111 S. 1st St. façade. A blade sign is also proposed.

A motion was made by Mr. Norris and seconded by Ms. Malay with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA.

8. COA: 506 N. 2nd Ave. (fence)

Mr. Colby showed the proposed fence design.

Mr. Pretz asked if the existing fence is being replaced. Margaret Biancofiori, applicant, said there is currently no fence. She said they purchased the house two years ago.

Chairman Smunt expressed support for the design.

Mr. Biancofiori said they may not move forward with the proposed brick pillars along the front due to an increase in the quoted price. Ms. Biancofiori said the pillars would match the brick and limestone tops currently on either side of the front steps. She said if they do not do the brick pillars, they would use the matching fence posts.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Bobowiec with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA, with the condition that the brick pillars match the existing house materials, or may be omitted.

9. COA: 511 Illinois Ave. (sign)

Mr. Norris asked what the material will be for the sign. He wanted to ensure it would not be plywood. Mr. Rasmussen, building owner, said it looks like a painted sandblasted sign.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Norris with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA.

10. COA: 117-123 S. 3rd St. (windows)

Mr. Colby said four windows have been replaced on the building without a permit. He asked the applicant to clarify which windows were replaced.

Andrea Dutkovich, applicant, said two first floor windows in the middle of the rear (west elevation) and the two first floor windows to the left of the front door (east elevation) were replaced.

Mr. Dutkovich said a previous owner had replaced many of the windows. All the windows are different; some are vinyl, some are wood, and some are aluminum.

Chairman Smunt asked if the four replacement windows are the same style as the ones they replaced. Mr. Dutkovich confirmed.

Chairman Smunt said it is unknown what the original window style was for the building. He said they were probably wood, one-over-one sash. It is hard to say when the multi-light windows were added. The Commission has never approved any replacement windows on this building. He said that for buildings like this with significant history, the Commission wants to see

replacement windows that are like in kind to what was original. He said historical photos may give us an idea of the original window style. He asked which window style is dominant. Mr. Dutkovich said one-over-one are currently dominant.

Mr. Pretz asked if they will replace any additional windows. Ms. Dutkovich asked what would be most appropriate for future replacements.

Mr. Pretz said to make sure to come to the Commission meeting so the Commission can help them choose the best option. It is hard for the Commission to help after work has already been done.

Ms. Malay said the building is very significant. Wood windows would be the closest to the original. Mr. Dutkovich said that is why he added wood trim around the windows.

Pat Pretz found a historic photo that appeared to show divided lights.

Ms. Malay said divides could always be added to one-over-one windows.

Mr. Gibson said if wood windows were still present the Commission would recommend replacing with wood. One-over-one may not have been the original window style, but that is an old style of window. He stated he would not have a problem with one-over-one in this situation, although a rebuilt wood window would be best.

Mr. Dutkovich said the existing wood windows are deteriorated. Someone replaced about 18 of the windows with vinyl.

Chairman Smunt asked if most windows are now vinyl. Mr. Dutkovich confirmed. Chairman Smunt said the issue with vinyl is that it cannot be painted. He said the original windows may have been painted. They do not have to remain white, which is what Ms. Dutkovich believed.

Chairman Smunt said that because there already are so many vinyl windows on the building, he does not have a problem with the applicants staying with the same one-over-one, vinyl window system moving forward, if a high quality vinyl window is used.

Ms. Malay said if they ever want to bring it back to the original style, go with a wood window with aluminum cladding. Ms. Malay told the applicant to keep the Façade Improvement Grant program in mind in the future.

Mr. Colby said funds are no longer available for this year. Applications for next year will be accepted beginning in February 2016. He said the grant it is capped at \$20,000 per building.

Mr. Pretz told the applicants that the Commission is happy to discuss ideas with building owners at any time.

Mr. Dutkovich inquired about replacing a first floor rear door, which is wood. Another door has already been replaced. He showed a photo of the potential replacement door, as well as a photo showing the deterioration of the existing wood door.

Chairman Smunt said the replacement door is a Craftsman style door. The building pre-dates the Craftsman style. However for the back of the building, it is more of a utility door. The existing door has a larger window, but that is not secure. It would make more sense to have a solid door, or a door with a small window, like what is being proposed. The significant elevations are what faces 3rd St. and Illinois St. The Commission is more flexible on the rear and would support the proposed door.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Bobowiec with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA for the four windows that have already been replaced (two on west elevation and two on east elevation) and replacement of the rear door with a Craftsman style aluminum or steel door.

Mr. Dutkovich said they would like to add a deck to the back of the building in the future.

Mr. Colby said there were decks in the rear before that the previous owner started to repair, but the building inspector said they needed to be replaced or removed due to the condition. The owner removed them and rebuilt the staircase.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Gibson with a unanimous voice vote to amend the agenda to move item the discussion item under item #12 to #11.

12. Discussion Item: 305 W. Main St.

David Reyes, lessee of 305 W. Main St., said that he and his wife plan to open a contemporary American bistro in that location. The front windows are damaged. They would like to remove the windows and glass block and replace them with accordion style windows that would open to the inside. The windows would go down to the terra cotta.

Commissioners questioned whether the glass block is original to the structure. The applicant said the building was built in 1906. Chairman Smunt said the glass block was probably an early

addition. He said the significant part of the building is the terra cotta with the entrance surround. There may have been a transom window system across the top.

Mr. Reyes said they plan to return the transom to the top across the windows. He showed a picture of the type of window system they are going for. Commissioners expressed support for the windows.

Chairman Smunt asked about a screen. Mr. Reyes said a pull-down screen is a possibility. Commissioners said a screen would be needed.

Mr. Reyes said they would also like to replace the door with one of a similar design. The door will be higher to line up with the transoms across the top. He said they plan to either get rid of the awning and mount the sign to the transom, or go straight across the full storefront with the awning.

Chairman Smunt said the transom is the sign panel. Chairman Bobowiec asked why they would want to spend money on the transom and then cover it with a sign. Mr. Reyes said the transom is a necessity with the type of windows they are installing.

Chairman Smunt said the awning should not cover the terra cotta that runs parallel to the left of the door as it would block that architectural component. The existing awning system works nicely.

Mr. Bobowiec suggested a retractable awning like the one on the River House. Ms. Malay said the sign lettering is visible even when the awning is retracted.

Mr. Reyes said they would like to open in July. They will name the restaurant The Finery.

Chairman Smunt asked about their plans for the west side windows. Juliette Reyes said they would like to leave them the same, with a sign potentially above. Chairman Smunt said that window system with the glass block is not original.

Mr. Reyes said they will leave the windows on that side for now. He said they would like to add flower boxes beneath the windows.

Mr. Norris said that is the gas station's property. Chairman Smunt said the City at one point wanted to add a pedestrian walkway along the building to the parking lot in back, but the gas station owner would not grant the easement.

Chairman Smunt said the Commission will need a scaled elevation showing the changes to the building. He said the Commission is in favor of what has been discussed.

Chairman Smunt said there is a sign and awning grant program through the Downtown St. Charles Partnership.

11. Landmark Nomination for 502 S. 4th Ave., Long House

Mr. Colby said the owner's signature is missing, but otherwise the application is complete. He said the last open question was the date of construction. Mr. Gibson had mentioned a map indicating an earlier construction date.

Mr. Gibson said he cannot find that map, so he was probably looking at a later map. Mr. Colby said the owner is fine with going with the 1852 date, although he had wanted to make it earlier. Chairman Smunt suggested going with circa 1852.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Gibson with a unanimous voice vote to set a public hearing date for the Landmark Nomination.

Chairman Smunt asked about whether the first criterion under item 'e', "Property has character, interest, or value which is part of the development, heritage, or cultural character of the community, county, or nation" applies to the property.

Mr. Gibson said Long was one of the masons that built St. Patrick's church, among other buildings. That information is in the descriptive statement.

Mr. Colby said the public hearing will be set for June 3.

12. Additional Business

a. Mobile Tour App Project

Mr. Gibson said he met with Allison at the St. Charles History Museum. In his opinion, she has already plotted a separate course from what the Commission is doing. She wants to include the Commission, but she is ready to move forward with or without our participation. He said he recommended Allison look into story.com, which is basically the same program the Commission has been looking at, but it includes beacons which are attached to tour destinations. The app tells you when you are close to one of the beacons. The beacons cost \$15 apiece and each site needs one. He said his recommendation would be to offer assistance where we can.

b. Landmarks Research

There were no updates.

c. Election of Officers

Chairman Smunt said he is available to be Chairman again. Mr. Norris said he is willing to be Vice Chair.

A motion was made by Mr. Norris and seconded by Mr. Bobowiec with a unanimous voice vote to nominate Mr. Smunt for Chair.

A motion was made by Mr. Bobowiec and seconded by Ms. Malay with a unanimous voice vote to nominate Mr. Norris for Vice Chair.

13. Announcements: Historic Preservation Commission meeting Wednesday, May 20, 2015 at 7:00 pm in the Council Committee Room.

14. Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 8:16 p.m.