

MINUTES
CITY OF ST. CHARLES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY, JULY 1, 2015
COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM

Members Present: Chairman Smunt, Norris, Withey, Malay, Pretz

Members Absent: Bobowiec, Gibson

Also Present: Russell Colby, Planning Division Manager
Ellen Johnson, Planner
Chris Sanchez, Recording Secretary

1. Call to order

Chairman Smunt called the meeting to order at 7:01 p.m.

2. Roll call

Chairman Smunt called roll with five members present. There was a quorum.

3. Approval of the agenda

Three items were added under Additional Business. Mr. Pretz added a general discussion on 215 N. 3rd Avenue (Item C). Ms. Malay added an update on the Bus Tour (Item D). Mr. Colby added a discussion item regarding 305 W. Main Street (Item E).

4. Presentation of minutes of the June 17, 2015 meeting

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Pretz with a majority voice vote to approve the minutes. Mr. Norris and Mr. Withey abstained.

5. COA: 190 S. 1st St. (new building)

Bob Rasmussen, developer, and Dan Marshall, architect, were present.

Chairman Smunt stated the proposal is close to what was presented during the PUD Preliminary Plan discussion. He asked the representatives to describe the changes that were made to the plan since that discussion.

Mr. Marshall said the base has changed. The original plan consisted of a brick and stone mix with some legs and brick coming down through it. This has all been changed to cast stone. Cast

stone will be used on the corners on top as well. Mr. Rasmussen said this is being done to help with water penetration, as the cast stone repels water better than limestone.

Chairman Smunt asked if the entryways recede into the store. Mr. Marshall said three are recessed, but the one on the right is not. In addition to the door, there are also two side panels. He said these are straight in rather than angled, creating a bay window feel. Mr. Rasmussen stated the last entryway is a vestibule that leads into a proposed restaurant. He said there is a secondary door inside so they cannot push it in any further. Mr. Marshall noted this one is not as wide as the other bays.

Mr. Rasmussen pointed out two windows in a stairwell that were added per the owner's request for natural lighting. This stairwell is the main access to the second and third floors.

Mr. Marshall asked if anyone knew of a way to get the open stair atrium to meet code without making a whole third stair. He mentioned they could not find a feasible way around that. He stated the atrium on the inside was filled in for useable space. He said the owner wanted that space on the floor rather than a pole, so they added some Spandrel glass to cover the space of the floor lines.

Mr. Pretz asked if the ALE lettering will be made of cement. Mr. Rasmussen said the owner would like to engrave the limestone blocks. Mr. Marshall stated he is pushing for it to be made out of tile. He felt it would look nicer as a colorful mosaic.

Mr. Marshall said there will be more refinement of the little things as they move along with the project.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Norris with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.

6. COA: 18 N. 4th St. (doors)

Mr. Colby presented photos of the existing doors on the old church building. The representative said the doors are in pretty bad shape. Chairman Smunt said they look like they need some paint and asked what other damage existed. The representative referred to a close-up picture of the doors and said they cannot be painted. Chairman Smunt asked the representative for the design she selected. She showed a brochure with some options being considered.

Ms. Malay said they were asked to use a wood door. Representative stated it was actually fiberglass.

Chairman Smunt commented on the picture in the brochure. He said the door being considered looked too residential. He suggested she use $\frac{3}{4}$ height glass which he felt was better suited for commercial use.

Mr. Pretz said if she chooses a door with a slender window, it would appear as a “secret” on the other side. For commercial purposes, the Commissioners felt a door with a wider window would be more inviting so customers could see each other as they come and go. Chairman Smunt said most commercial doors consist of full or $\frac{3}{4}$ height glass.

Chairman Smunt said the picture shown is of a full length window with an arc on top and this is in line with what is currently there. Ms. Malay asked if the opening will remain the same size as it currently is. The representative confirmed there will be no change in size.

Chairman Smunt asked if they were going to have a window along the side. The representative stated the sidelight will match the door.

The representative said they were going to paint the arch the same color as the door. Chairman Smunt said the color choice is up to her. Mr. Pretz said if she is unsure of the color when it comes time to paint, she can come back and bring samples for further discussion.

A motion was made by Mr. Withey and seconded by Ms. Malay with a unanimous voice vote to approve the COA as presented.

7. COA: 104 S. 3rd Ave. (windows)

Chairman Smunt briefly reviewed the discussion from the last meeting. He noted this request was viewed as a replacement of all the windows. He stated the last discussion regarding the use of vinyl seemed to indicate an opposition to approving that kind of change. He mentioned the comments included using wood, a like-in-kind product, for all new windows, or replacing the damaged windows with wood and rehabbing the rest of the existing windows as needed. Chairman Smunt said they needed to know the condition of the existing windows in order to make a final recommendation. He noted the owner was not present at the last meeting so the request was tabled.

Mr. Colby said he shared the information from the last meeting with the owner and his contractor. He said he thinks they may not have decided what to do yet, but it would be appropriate for the Commission to deny the proposal as is.

Ms. Malay noted the owner was once again absent from the meeting.

A motion was made by Mr. Norris and seconded by Mr. Withey to approve the COA as presented. The vote was 0 ayes to 5 nays; motion failed.

A motion was made by Ms. Malay and seconded by Mr. Withey with a unanimous voice vote to recommend denial of the COA based upon the criteria discussed at the June 17th, 2015 meeting: the proposal does not meet items 3b, 3e, and 3f of the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation as provided in the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

8. Additional Business

a. Mobile Tour App Project

No updates.

b. Landmarks Research

No updates.

c. 215 N. 3rd Avenue

Mr. Pretz informed the Commission that he now owns this property in partnership with a neighbor. He said it is a two-unit Queen Anne style home that he is proposing re-converting to a single family home. He said one update he will be making is to the porch area that includes an extra side door. He is planning on opening the porch up to make it part of the kitchen. It will become a sitting area. He is hoping to remove the door and replace it with a few windows. He is also planning on removing the steps to the existing porch door. Mr. Pretz referred to some pictures of the property to explain where these changes will be made.

Mr. Pretz showed a picture of the west side of the house. He said the secondary entrance will be eliminated and most likely closed up. He plans on painting the house a deep gray color with white trim.

Chairman Smunt asked about the siding. Mr. Pretz said it mainly consists of vinyl.

Mr. Pretz said he will bring any other style changes before the Commission.

Chairman Smunt asked about the gable material. Mr. Pretz said it is original and he is planning on preserving it. Chairman Smunt said it is a nice Queen Anne feature.

Mr. Withey asked if the windows will stay. Mr. Pretz said they need some repair, but they will stay as is.

The Commissioners had a discussion regarding the condition of the basement.

Mr. Pretz asked if a permit was needed to remove the porches. Mr. Colby advised him to get one for demolition purposes.

d. Historic Bus Tour

Ms. Malay stated she attended a meeting which included Mark Koenen. She said she told Mr. Koenen about the Commission's plans to have a bus tour for the City Council members and he thought it was a great idea, but felt the fall was a better time to do this due to the Council's schedule. Chairman Smunt said he talked to Alderman Bessner, who felt a Monday night would be best. Ms. Malay mentioned Mr. Koenen thought a Saturday morning might also be a possibility.

e. 305 W. Main Street

Mr. Colby said Mr. Norris spotted some issues with a door at this location. Mr. Colby said one of the doors was removed and bricked over. Mr. Colby was unsure if the building owner or the tenant did this, but noted a permit was not requested for this work.

Chairman Smunt stated he would like to see a side-by-side comparison showing the door before and after this work to determine which looks better. He said the City will need to review this again.

Ms. Malay expressed concern over future businesses wanting access to a door.

Mr. Colby referred to a center door at the Mr. Marco's Jewelry building that was also changed. Ms. Malay stated the owner is aware of the process. Chairman Smunt said they can be cited for making this change. He noted the current door is a craftsman style that does not match the style of the building. Mr. Pretz asked if the owner will be cited. Mr. Colby said they should be because the work that was done required a permit and the owner did not apply for one.

9. Announcements: Historic Preservation Commission meeting Wednesday, July 15, 2015 at 7:00 pm in the Council Committee Room.

10. Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 7:50 p.m.